



M. Cottias

A note on 18th- and 19th-century plantation inventories from Martinique

In: New West Indian Guide/ Nieuwe West-Indische Gids 64 (1990), no: 1/2, Leiden, 1-6

**This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>**

MYRIAM COTTIAS

A NOTE ON 18TH- AND 19TH-CENTURY PLANTATION  
INVENTORIES FROM MARTINIQUE<sup>1</sup>

When reading through Martiniquan slave inventories for any particular year, one quickly realizes that they must have been written out at some early stage and then copied over from one year to the next.<sup>2</sup> When slaves died, their names were simply crossed off the list, and while slaves who were present for at least a year are listed in a careful calligraphy, new arrivals and newborns are listed in a quickly dashed off hand. The following year, their names are copied over with care; henceforth these slaves are full members of the plantation.

Each plantation had its own mode of classifying slaves: by age (with the sexes combined), by age and sex (beginning in 1835 for Plantation Acajou), or following some other order that is often difficult to detect at first but which points toward the existence of coherent, identifiable groupings of slaves. When one plantation is linked to another (as is the case for the Gagneron Desvallons sugar plantation, which had been taken over in 1782 by that of Papin de l'Epine), the original mode of classification is maintained: in this case for example, the slaves of Gagneron Desvallons are listed first, followed by the slaves of Papin de l'Epine and the new arrivals. It is possible, then, to follow the same slaves year after year, with a confirmation of individual's identity because of the practice of listing by both name and age.<sup>3</sup>

But the logic behind the ordering of these lists, their organizing principle, remained a puzzle. I began with each slave's age and sex (deduced from the Christian name). Plantation after plantation, name after name, I drew up lists that might provide a clue.

Influenced by the works of Gabriel Debien (especially, Debien 1941), I began by searching for an organization by task groups or gangs. I looked for listings that could have grouped slaves who were, for example,

TABLE 1: PARTIAL LIST FROM THE DU MAUGÉ PLANTATION, 1825

Sex (deduced from name)	Age
F	44
F	42
M	38
M	38
F	37
M	42
M	39

domestics, artisans (carpenters, masons), cowherds, field slaves (the first and second gang), children (the third gang), newborns in the care of a nursemaid, and men and women confined for punishment. On the lists, such subgroupings would be readily apparent, since (at least in the case of the first, second and third gangs) they are age-specific. Also, one could expect to find listed just above the young children one or two female “drivers”, and above the infants, a nursemaid. Of the five major plantations in Lamentin, only Acajou provides a test for this hypothesis, as its slaves are listed by age-groupings and sex. But the results appear to be negative: though there seems to be a group of children, they have neither a female driver or nursemaid listed with them. Fortunately, the Du Maugé plantation provides a further test: in 1825, in addition to its usual listings, it registers each slave by task. But again, the hypothesis is not borne out: the drivers (male and female) are not listed first (suggesting the lack of importance given the hierarchy on Martiniquan plantations more generally,<sup>4</sup> and the order of listing does not follow tasks – Zacharie, 33, a field slave, is listed ahead of Severin, 34, who is a driver, who is followed by Louis, 36, who is a carpenter. And if the sextuagenarians are listed first in this inventory, the subsequent listings from the Du Maugé plantation use a system that takes no heed of age and sex. Confronted with the realization that these lists do not group slaves by tasks or gangs, I decided to explore the possibility that they were ordered by some sort of kingship or domestic considerations. I began to restudy the lists, by focusing on women of reproductive age, looking at who preceded and who followed them on the page. When the age difference between a woman and those who followed was at least fifteen years, I assumed there could have been a maternal link. The results of applying this perspective were of the kind that makes research such a pleasure: I found that after many women’s names there were others listed in decreasing order of age. This was the clue that suggested we were indeed dealing with mothers and their children.

TABLE 2: PARTIAL LISTS FOR THE PETIT-MORNE COFFEE PLANTATION, 1766

Sex	Age	Women over 15	Groups
F	40	x	}
M	15		
F	62	x	}
M	32		
F	29	x	
F	31	x	}
M	26		
F	14		
M	9		
F	3		
F	57	x	}
M	20		
F	8		
M	7		

Before accepting this interpretation, I decided to seek confirmation from the records of at least one of the major Lamentin plantations. The lists for the Gagneron Desvallons/Papin de l'Epine plantation seemed potentially useful, since many family ties between slaves are explicitly mentioned. Although these data are far from systematic, they permit the reconstruction of a number of family or domestic groups which, with few exceptions, turn out to have been female-centered. In the listings for 1766, for example, the groups headed by a mother (or more rarely a father) are quite clear from records, and the independently-verified existence of nine family groups provides striking confirmation of my hypothesis, when the corresponding standard lists are examined. In the lists, the members of each group are arranged one after the other.

Using the newly-rediscovered logic behind these lists, we can isolate 38 family groups which included 159 individuals – 62% of the total population of 225. Adopting this method<sup>5</sup> and applying it to other plantations, we find that in 1799, 27 women on the Petit-Morne sugar plantation were followed on the lists by 67 children and/or grandchildren. Of the 162 slaves on the plantation, 102 (or 63%) belonged to family units.<sup>6</sup> Likewise, in 1766 on the Petit-Morne coffee plantation, there were seven family groups, including 24 individuals, or 55% of the total population. Such statistics turn out to be quite consistent (though all are

TABLE 3: FAMILY TIES ON THE GAGNERON DESVALLONS/PAPIN DE L'EPINE PLANTATION, 1766 (ACCORDING TO THE INVENTORIES)

Names	Mention of family ties	Sexe	Age	Women over 15	Groups
Jacqueline	Jacqueline's	F	40	x	}
Jean-Louis		M	23		
Jacob Gaudau	Jacob's	M	40		}
Guillemette		F	32	x	
Jean-Philippe		M	12		
Jean-Noël		M	11		
Rose	Jacob's	F	9		}
Perine		F	7		
Louis	Jacob's	M	5		}
Magdeleine		F	1		
Lisette	Lisette's	F	60	x	}
Geneviève		F	30	x	
Charlotte		F	28	x	
Suzanne		F	11		
Jean-Pierre	Charlotte's	M	3		}
Joachim		M	1		

certainly underestimates, since some of the slaves I count as living alone probably belonged to the unit listed just before or after their names), and they are very similar to those established by Higman (1984:356): for example, in St. Lucia in 1815, 69% of rural slaves and 55% of urban slaves lived in family groups.

The method reveals other surprises. We often find several children of the same age listed after an older woman's name, suggesting that children did not necessarily live with their mothers (whether because of the mother's death or absence, or for some other reason). Keeping such considerations in mind, and using the information on family ties in the embryonic genealogies for the Gagneron Desvallons/Papin de l'Epine plantations, I found seven types of domestic groups (Table 4).

In short, strong kinship ties existed on Martiniquan plantations, and the groupings were largely matricentric: 71% on the Gagneron Desvallons/Papin de l'Epine plantation in 1766, and 63% on the Petit-Morne sugar plantation for the same year.<sup>7</sup> These statistics prefigure those for Martinique just after Emancipation, when more than 60% of families (or domestic units) were matricentric. I might note also that such ties were especially strong among the oldest slaves, those whose situation was most stable.

TABLE 4: DOMESTIC GROUPS ON THE GAGNERON DESVALLONS/PAPIN DE L'EPINE SUGAR PLANTATION, 1766

Description	Number of cases	%
Mother/child	19	50
Mother/daughter/grandchildren	3	8
Mother/child + other peoples' children	2	5
Mother/child with partner/grandchildren + other peoples' children	2	5
Mother/children with one with partner/ couple's children	1	3
Father/children	2	5
Couple/children	9	24

Newer slave arrivals were more frequently moved: in 1772, five slaves belonging to the Gagneron-Desvallons/Papin de l'Epine plantations left for a coffee plantation; they had arrived four years earlier and there are no indications that they had developed family ties on the plantation.

Finally, I might mention that the practice of listing slaves by family groups on the inventories does not depend, as one might expect, on the plantation's size or crop. It seems to depend, rather, on the plantation's style of management and the preference of the master.

TABLE 5: SYSTEM OF CLASSIFYING SLAVES ON PLANTATIONS, ACCORDING TO CROP AND YEAR

Plantations	Year	Number of slaves	System of classifying
Petit-Morne, sugar	1799	162	family groups
Petit-Morne, coffee	1766	44	family groups
Gagneron Desvallons/ Papin de l'Epine, sugar	1766	180	family groups
Du Maugé, sugar	1819/1825	109	no order
Acajou, sugar	1800	164	sex and age

## NOTES

1. The author would like to thank Lucy Voza for translation and Richard Price for helpful reading and comments on a draft of this paper. An earlier version of some of these materials appeared in French in *Population* 1988 (3): 660-64.

2. Engerman, in his commentary on Gutman 1976, notes similarly: "...it is not known whether the various lists were prepared sequentially over long time periods by one or more individuals and not revised, or elsewhere copied or prepared by one individual at a later date" (1978: 85).
3. The slaves' ages may well be "false", but they remain consistent through time on the inventories: it was not possible to verify them independently.
4. Debien made this point long ago regarding the l'Anse-à-l'Anc plantation (1960: 18).
5. Gutman used a similar method to establish paternal ties that did not otherwise appear in the historical record. He assumed that the name of the man who appeared at the top of a section of a plantation inventory that included children was their father (1976: 108, 115). It is worth noting, however, that the census materials used by Gutman had been gathered cabin-by-cabin, while for Martinique, there is no indication that this was the case.
6. Eight women were preceded by one man, on the basis of whose age he is included in the unit.
7. On the Bisdary plantation studied by Arlette Gautier, "80% of the slaves born on the plantation were brought up by their mother and father" (1984: 43).

#### REFERENCES

- COTTIAS, MYRIAM, 1988. Ordre de raison ou raison d'ordre? Les dénombrements des habitations de la Martinique aux XVIII<sup>e</sup> et XIX<sup>e</sup> siècles. *Population* 3: 659-82.
- DEBIEN, GABRIEL, 1941. *Une Plantation de Saint-Domingue. La sucrerie Galbaud du Fort (1690-1802)*. Cairo.
- , 1960. *Destinées d'esclaves à la Martinique (1764-1778)*. Dakar, IFAN.
- ENGERMAN, STANLEY L., 1978. Studying the Black family. *Journal of Family History* 3: 78-101.
- GAUTIER, ARLETTE, 1984. Les esclaves de l'habitation Bisdary (1763-1817). *Bulletin de la Société d'Histoire de la Guadeloupe* 60: 13-50.
- GUTMAN, HERBERT G., 1976. *The Black family in slavery and freedom, 1750-1925*. New York, Pantheon.
- HIGMAN, B.W., 1984. *Slave populations of the British Caribbean, 1807-1834*. Baltimore, Johns Hopkins University Press.

MYRIAM COTTIAS  
26, rue de Picpus  
75012-Paris, France.

JOHN M. LIPSKI

TRINIDAD SPANISH:  
IMPLICATIONS FOR AFRO-HISPANIC LANGUAGE

INTRODUCTION: THE CONTROVERSY SURROUNDING *BOZAL* SPANISH

The question of Spanish language usage among African-born slaves (known as *bozales*) and their descendents in Spanish America is the subject of much controversy, and has had a major impact on theories of creole formation and the evolution of Latin American dialects of Spanish, Portuguese and French. Briefly, one school of thought maintains that, at least during the last 150-200 years of African slave trade to Spanish America, *bozales* and their immediate descendants spoke a relatively uniform Spanish pidgin or creole, concentrated in the Caribbean region but ostensibly extending even to many South American territories. This creole in turn had Afro-Portuguese roots, derived from if not identical to the hypothetical maritime Portuguese creole (sometimes also identified with the medieval Sabir or Lingua Franca) claimed to be the source of most European - based creoles in Africa, Asia and the Americas.<sup>1</sup> The principal sources of evidence come in 19th century documents from the Caribbean region, principally Cuba and Puerto Rico, where many (but not all) *bozal* texts share a noteworthy similarity with other demonstrably Afro-Portuguese or Afro-Hispanic creoles in South America, Africa and Asia.<sup>2</sup>

Other researchers, comparing existent Afro-Hispanic texts and contemporary language, postulate that no such uniform *bozal* Spanish ever existed; what was found instead was a rudimentary and broken Spanish pidgin which arose spontaneously each time African speakers were forced to learn and use Spanish under unfelicitous conditions, and this pidgin naturally disappeared after one or two generations. Such Afro-Hispanic language would share few structural similarities from one region to the next, except



for those common to all forms of reduced language and 'foreigner talk', including phonological misidentification, unstable conjugation and concord, simplified syntax and preference for holophrastic utterances with emphasis on communication of basic necessities.

Critically important in assessing theoretical reconstructions of Afro-Hispanic language are test cases which depart from the structural parameters that define putative monogenetic theories of *bozal* Spanish. Among the variables which need to be individually isolated are contact with Spanish dialects where *bozal* features are known to have existed, linguistic input in the form of regional (non-Africanized) varieties of Spanish, and demonstrable existence of spontaneous creolization which differs in essential fashions from reconstructed pan-American *bozal* Spanish.

It is the last of these issues that is addressed by the present study, namely the possibility for development of Afro-Hispanic speech modes in the absence of a prior Afro-Lusitanian or monolithic *bozal* Spanish basis upon which to build. The following remarks focus on Spanish-speaking enclaves of Trinidad, which represent potentially significant sources of new evidence in the evaluation of theories of the African influence on Latin American Spanish. Based on examination of a corpus of recently-collected specimens, it is suggested that Trinidad Spanish as spoken by descendents of Africans shows evidence of earlier creoloid status. The same language samples provide little or no evidence of the unique Afro-Lusitanian creole features presupposed by monogenetic theories. While these data do not directly disconfirm monogenetic theories, they do suggest alternative routes of evolution, as well as greater heterogeneity among Afro-Hispanic linguistic communities throughout colonial and postcolonial Latin America.

#### THE SPANISH OF TRINIDAD

The official language of Trinidad is English, which at the vernacular level shades into an English-based creole. Earlier in this century, varieties of Hindi were spoken in many rural regions by Indian indentured laborers (Mohan and Zador 1986). In rural regions, creole French *patois* is still current, although few if any monolingual speakers remain. This language was once the lingua franca of all of Trinidad, for towards the end of the Spanish period, Spain encouraged French planters from the Caribbean to settle in Trinidad, together with their creole-speaking slaves. Further immigration resulted from the Haitian revolution, and the Francophone plantocracy together with patois-speaking slaves and free blacks dominated most of the colonial life during the British period. Finally, and despite

the close proximity to Venezuela and the historical links with Venezuelan Spanish, an undetermined but very small (considerably less than 1%) of Trinidad's native-born population speaks Spanish as a first or ancestral language; these speakers are scattered throughout the national territory.<sup>3</sup> No monolingual Spanish speakers are known to remain, and those Trinidadians who speak Spanish are usually trilingual Spanish/English/*patois* (Anthony 1985:36; Magid 1988:chap. 2). The entire population of Trinidad shares a Christmas tradition of singing folk songs in Spanish, known as *parang* (from *parranda*), although the majority of people who sing and even compose these songs are not fluent in Spanish and have an incomplete understanding of the lyrics (Moodie 1970).

Despite the tiny number of Spanish speakers in Trinidad, three partially overlapping sources for Trinidad Spanish can be identified. The first dates from the Spanish occupation, which lasted over 200 years, ending in 1797, but which never succeeded in settling more than a few hundred Spaniards on the island (Ottley 1971). The Spanish language was never firmly implanted, being immediately replaced by French, French creole and English following the transfer to British sovereignty at the end of the 18th century. Spain left behind no large plantation owners, government or military officials or significant merchant class which would have continued to speak Spanish following the shift of Trinidad's status and at a national level, the former Spanish linguistic presence is felt only in *parang* songs and place names. However, Spanish religious orders (especially the Capuchins) did establish schools and convents for the native Carib population, which then as now was never fully integrated into the *mestizo* and *criollo* population of Trinidad. Today, a few ethnic Caribs continue to speak Spanish, by all evidence a direct continuation of the instruction imparted by the Spanish religious figures, and their language represents the oldest surviving form of Spanish in Trinidad (Brereton 1979:165).

The second group of Trinidad Spanish speakers derives from the immigration of 'peons' from eastern Venezuela, beginning in the first decades of the 19th century and continuing for several decades thereafter (Brereton 1979:8; O'Connor 1978:44-45; Anthony 1974:18-19). Other Venezuelans have subsequently immigrated to Trinidad, but have quickly integrated themselves into the English-speaking society, and have left no appreciable linguistic traces (but cf. Richards 1966, 1970). The first immigrants, however, came from the most marginalized sectors of rural Venezuela, and upon arriving in Trinidad, worked primarily as agricultural laborers and subsistence-level farmers. Since their lives were centered on rural regions, and their socioeconomic condition was not conducive to wider integration, these individuals continued to speak Spanish, often

monolingually, at least until the middle of the 20th century, and many of their descendents are bilingual. Although they may occasionally visit Venezuela and make use of their Spanish language skills, they do not ordinarily maintain contact with other Venezuelans, do not listen to Venezuelan radio stations (which are easily heard in Trinidad) or practice recognizably Venezuelan customs.

The final subvariety of Trinidad Spanish, which will be the central focus of the present study, is spoken by descendents of African slaves who formed part of the Spanish colonial empire in the Caribbean. Although the majority of black slaves and laborers in Trinidad were brought following the departure of the Spaniards, and learned some form of English or creole French, an Afro-Hispanic presence is discernible in Trinidad, consisting of Spanish speakers descended from African slaves or servants either held in Trinidad or in Venezuela (Brereton 1981:25; Newson 1976:121; Magid 1988:chap. 2; Ottley 1971; Moodie 1970b). Unlike the Spanish American nations, in which the African presence is well documented in literary and cultural history, there is virtually no information concerning any variety of Trinidad Spanish spoken prior to the middle of the 20th century, nor of any language variety or register used by Africans in the colonial period. Descriptions of language and culture in Trinidad usually make no reference at all to the Spanish language, or briefly mention the disappearance of all Spanish cultural elements at the turn of the 19th century. Thus for example Brereton (1981:64) mentions that some old Spanish speakers were found around St. Joseph and Arima in the early 1800's [and still are: JML]. Anthony (1974:18-19) notes the continued existence of Spanish speakers in Lopinot, whence they moved from Caura, and Brereton (1979:131) mentions that Spanish was [and still is: JML] spoken among half-castes (mixed European-Amerindian-African) in Arima and the surrounding area. The *Area Handbook for Trinidad* (Black et al. 1976:79), purportedly an objective compilation of geographical and cultural facts, makes the misleading statement that 'French and Spanish creole' is still spoken in some isolated areas. While French creole (*patois*) is still found in Trinidad, there is no Spanish *creole*, but only nonstandard but non-creolized Spanish. Brereton (1979:137) mentions the previous existence of a group of disbanded black soldiers in Manzanilla, who were given land to settle beginning in 1815, and who spoke a 'mixture of military English, Spanish and African languages'; regardless of the accuracy of this designation, the group in question had all but disappeared by 1870. Oxaal (1982:chap. 3) makes the briefest of mention of (earlier) Spanish language, while MacDonald (1986:34-5) states that Afro-Creoles 'often spoke a form of local patois (mixed Spanish, French and English), which was not easily

understood by English authorities'. In 1872, a bishop in Port of Spain stated that 'the language talked in the streets is the scouring of Babel, a negro commixture of French, Spanish and African, to which for Coolies [East Indians] is added mashed English' (Brereton 1979:164). These statements, which are empirically meaningless, reflect two common misconceptions found throughout Latin America, both reflecting racially-motivated prejudice. The first regards the status of creole languages or other folk vernaculars, widely regarded (by outsiders, and by self-effacing apologists from within the groups in question) as patchwork mixtures, devoid of grammatical structure, lacking the capacity for intellectual expression, and having no societal value. The second stereotype, partially overlapping with the first, is that of the 'unintelligibility' of Afro-American speech of any language basis. Remarks to this effect (without exception made by observers of European origin) abound for black American English as well as West Indian English and French, both creolized and noncreolized, and similar statements are found regarding Papiamentu, Brazilian Portuguese as spoken by marginalized black citizens, and Spanish as spoken by Afro-Americans in many countries (Lipski 1985a). The linguistic reality behind such assertions varies; in some cases the Afro-American groups in question do speak a different language or dialect from that of other residents of the same regions, while in other cases what is at stake is simple nonstandard speech of socially marginalized groups of all racial backgrounds.

Coupled with the lack of data on earlier stages of Trinidad Spanish is the absence of accurate linguistic data on Venezuelan Spanish from the regions and groups which reflect immigration to Trinidad in the 19th century. Some configurations can be reconstructed by considering contemporary Venezuelan Spanish, as well as other Caribbean dialects, but an element of indeterminacy remains (cf. Megenney 1988 for Afro-Venezuelan linguistic traits). Finally, vestigial Trinidad Spanish contains a high proportion of semifluent speakers, representing the final stages of a once widespread language, spoken in isolation and in the absence of corrective tendencies; this type of situation, which is normally unstable and lasts at most a generation or two, is conducive to the rapid expansion and even creation of nonstandard and ungrammatical combinations which do not occur among fully fluent speakers. Some configurations produced by semifluent or vestigial Spanish speakers are virtually identical to those attested in earlier periods for nonfluent Afro-Hispanic language (Lipski 1985b); and render difficult the separation of sources of nonstandard material in a given corpus. Despite these caveats, which make any analysis of contemporary Trinidad Spanish at best a tentative approximation, a

research paradigm is possible, and promises to yield key data for comparative Afro-Hispanic linguistics.

#### POSSIBLE *BOZAL*-TYPE FEATURES IN TRINIDAD SPANISH<sup>4</sup>

##### *Legitimacy of Trinidad data for bozal studies*

No application of Trinidadian materials in the reconstruction of *bozal* Spanish will ever carry the same probative weight as a study based on first-hand transcription of living speech communities. *Bozal* Spanish is no longer spoken anywhere (although stable creoles such as Papiamentu and Colombian Palanquero provide indirect evidence of its existence), and early written attestations are notoriously unreliable. In the case of Trinidad Spanish as spoken by Afro-Americans known or supposed to have descended from Spanish-speaking *bozales*, scanty documentation of previous speech patterns, the small size of the group and its social and geographical isolation from other Spanish-speaking communities make it impossible to entirely rule out that forms which deviate from contemporary varieties of Spanish and/or which strongly resemble descriptions of *bozal* speech are the result of linguistic drift and language death.<sup>5</sup> The following observations embody the claim that enough survivals of *bozal* speech remain in Trinidad Spanish to warrant a systematic comparison with other *bozal* attestations. Although proof lies beyond the scope of the present inquiry, no examples were included in the list of possible *bozal* carryovers that are normally found in any known variety of Spanish, past or present. The speakers whose interviews form the corpus for the present study were quite fluent in Spanish, thus reducing considerably the possibility that language erosion is the main source of configurations which would be grammatically deviant in other Spanish dialects. The conclusion to be drawn is therefore that these deviations represent the evolution of earlier *bozal* forms, which from the beginning were in contact with more or less standard varieties of Spanish in the Caribbean. The following paragraphs contain a pairwise comparison between *bozal* and creole Spanish characteristics and the Trinidad corpus, in an attempt to demonstrate that whereas *bozal*/pidgin features are prevalent in Trinidad Spanish, 'leading indicators' found among Afro-Iberian creoles and used to bolster monogenetic theories of creole formation are conspicuously absent. In view of the nature of the present corpus, and the questionable accuracy of written *bozal* texts, it is not feasible to give the quantitative data regarding occurrence of key forms in Trinidad Spanish as opposed to combinations which are found

in other Spanish dialects, but whenever possible, general observations of frequency will be offered.

### *Lack of verbal particles*

The principal syntactic pattern claimed as evidence of a pan-Hispanic *bozal* dialect, namely use of the verbal particles in constructions of the type *ta* + *V<sub>inf</sub>* (e.g. Papiamentu *mi ta skirbi* 'I write/am writing'), are absent in Trinidad. Moodie (a) detected one ambiguous case involving what appeared to be the combination *yo ta olvida*. In this particular example, which is unique in a corpus representing a significant subset of Trinidadian Spanish speakers, the articulation is slurred and this combination may well result from the usual process of morphological erosion and insecurity which characterizes Spanish vestigial and semi-speakers.

### *Reduction of verbal morphology*

Most *bozal* Spanish texts, from the late 16th century onwards and representing Spain and Latin America, show an unstable use of conjugated verbs, rather than bare uninflected infinitives. The most common manifestation is the third person singular verb form (the least marked), followed by use of the third person plural form instead of the first person plural. Nearly every interviewed speaker produced at least some examples of unstable verb conjugation, a phenomenon which is vanishingly rare in even the most nonstandard Spanish of other nations. Naturally, the proportion of grammatically deviant conjugated forms rises among true semifluent speakers (whose speech has not been included among the present examples), but among the latter group the deviations are more random, whereas among more fluent Spanish speakers the gravitation in favor of third person forms is noteworthy. Examples from Trinidad include:

*Tó nojotro trabajaban [trabajábamos] junto* 'we all worked together'  
*Yo tiene [tengo] cuarenta ocho año* 'I am 48 years old'  
*Asina, yo pone [pongo] todo* 'I put everything like that'  
*me alegre [alegro] de ehcuchá eso* 'I am glad to hear that'  
*ehtoy [soy] de la Cueva* 'I am from La Cueva'  
*Yo no sabe [sé] bien* 'I don't know'  
*yo no sabe [sé] na de lé* 'I don't know anything about reading'  
*yo mimo [misma] me enfelmó [enfermé]* 'I myself got sick'  
*un poco, no habla [hablo] claro* 'a little, I don't speak clearly'  
*ello habla [n] medio venezolano y medio indio* 'they speak half Venezuelan

(Spanish) and half Indian (Hindu)'

*uté no puedo [puede] decil, yo soy un ehpañol* 'you can't say, I'm a Spaniard'  
*ello no coge[n] la gente de Ehpaña* 'they don't hire (Spanish-speaking) people'  
*nosotro ten[emos] otro pehcado que se come bueno* 'we have another fish that is good to eat'

*hahta la fecha yo tiene [tengo] conuco* 'until now I have a plot of land'  
*de que yo vive [vivo] en ese paí* 'what I live off in this country'

*tienes [tiene] tre pie de alto* 'he is three feet tall'

*cuando yo viene [vine], tiene [tuve] que trabajá mucho* 'when I came here, I had to work hard'

*yo tienes [tengo] grandeh por ahí* 'I have some big (trees) over there'

*paltera lo llamo [llamamos] nosotros* 'we call them midwives'

*nació [nací] en La Pastora* 'I was born in La Pastora'.

### *Reduction of nominal/adjectival morphology*

In Afro-Romance creoles, elimination of nominal and adjectival gender is the rule. Among semifluent speakers and in all *bozal* Spanish texts, partial neutralization of nominal and adjectival gender is frequent, and takes the form of nonetymological gender or number assignment, or of inconsistent use of gender and number morphemes across a single noun phrase. As with the case of verb conjugations, nearly all Trinidad speakers produced at least some tokens of unstable gender and number assignment, and as in established creoles, the gravitation toward the masculine gender and the singular form was evident. Among fluent speakers of other nonstandard Spanish dialects, this type of morphological instability is very unusual, except in the case of a few words with fluctuating gender (e.g. *calor* 'heat'). Discrepancies of number assignment are essentially nonexistent among other Spanish dialects. Examples of reduction of nominal/adjectival morphology from Trinidad include:

*Ahora tiene casa[s] uno [unas] sobre otro [otras]* 'now there are houses on top of one another'

*una mujel mayol como yo mimo [misma]* 'an older woman like me'

*la gente ehpañol [española] de Trinidad lo llame* 'Spanish-speakers in Trinidad call it ...'

*los [las] gentes de allá, cuando taba mal* 'the people there, when times were bad ...'

*lo que ello ehtudian en lo [las] ehcucla* 'what they study in school'

*un[a] canción en ehpañol* 'a song in Spanish'

*yo trabajaba en la [el] puelto* 'I used to work in Port of Spain'

*no poco día ninguna [ningún] paí* 'a few of them didn't go to any other country'

*el [café] arábica [arábico] é mejol* 'Arabic coffee is best'

*tiene un caro [carro] de la gobiehna [del gobierno]* 'he has a government car'

*yo tengo una libra [un libro] de oración en ehpañol* 'I have a Spanish prayer book'

*tenían los [las] hacienda lo gente rico [la gente rica]* 'the rich people had plantations'

*la tierra [tierra] eh bueno [buena]* 'the land is good'.

### *Modifications of the personal pronoun system*

Personal pronouns are rarely affected in nonstandard or semifluent Spanish speech, but creoles often exhibit neutralization of pronominal case. In most Afro-Iberian creoles, this is evident in the replacement of *yo/eu* 'I' by (a)*mí* 'me', and third person pronouns are frequently neutralized to a single form (e.g. Papiamentu *e* (s.), *nan* (pl.)). In the Trinidad corpus, pronominal modifications occur occasionally, and do not point unequivocally to an earlier period when pronominal confusion was more common. However, in nonstandard Spanish of other regions, the occasional pronominal substitutions that do occur are limited to clitic pronouns or the use of subject pronouns after prepositions. Thus the appearance in Trinidad Spanish of object pronouns in subject position, or subject pronouns as possessives, albeit rare, may indeed be the final glimmers of an earlier creoloid pronoun system. Examples include:

*Si pa mí [yo] tocaba un cuatro, yo no volví cantá* 'If I knew how to play the cuatro, I wouldn't sing any more'

*me complace de encontrarse [me] con uhdedeh* 'I'm pleased to meet you'  
*si el gobierno encontraba con tú [te encontraba] con calzón largo* 'if the officials caught you wearing long pants'

*La salga eh buena pa uté [su] cabeza* 'Willow [bark] is good for headaches'.

The last example may reflect creole English usage, which would have 'you/ya head' instead of 'your head'.

### *Elision of prepositions*

This is a common feature of all *bozal* Spanish texts. In other nonstandard Spanish dialects, phonetic erosion may result in loss of *de* and *a* in rapid



speech, but there is usually at least some perceptible residue. In Trinidad Spanish at all levels of fluency, loss of *de* and *a* is frequent, at times even in slow speech, thus indicating that true loss has occurred; substitution of other prepositions is less common:

*Hay un poco [de] cacao* 'There's a little cacao'

*Bahtante fueron [a] diferente lugal* 'Many people went to different places'

*Si uté pasa [por la] casa [de] Lili* 'If you pass Lili's house'

*tengo como nuevas año [de] no habla español* 'I have not spoken Spanish in about nine years'

*todo son [están en] Trinidad* 'they are all in Trinidad'

*un piazó [pedazo de] velso que yo mihmo canté* 'a little verse that I sang myself'

*diferente clase fruto [clases de frutas]* 'different kinds of fruit'

*con uté ta sufriendo con la cabeza* 'if you have a headache'.

### *Reduction of syntactic complexity*

This is a catchall category referring to generally simplified grammatical structures, avoidance of embedded clauses, conditional sentences and relative pronouns, normally in violation of established grammatica norms. *Bozal* Spanish was characterized by short minimally complex sentences; in Afro-Iberian creoles, this pattern has largely been maintained, with semantically complex ideas being expressed through juxtaposition of syntactically undifferentiated clauses, rather than employing an overtly marked system of verbal subordination. Trinidad Spanish at all levels of fluency tends toward minimization of syntactic embedding, such as relative clause formation. There is a wide variety of syntactic phenomena among nonstandard Spanish dialects, but the following examples from the Trinidad corpus contain syntactic reductions which would be ungrammatical elsewhere in the Spanish-speaking world:

*Tú tiene [cuando tú tengas] tiempo, viene aquí* 'when you have time, come back here'

*La gente aquí [que] hablaron [hablaba] español se murieron* 'The people here who could speak Spanish all died'

*hay bahtante otro negocio que sabemo el nombre lo olvidamo* 'there are lots of other things whose names we know but we forget them'

*si yo encuentro persona [que] hablan ehpañol, yo creo que yo nunca habla inglés* 'if I met someone who knew Spanish I don't think I would ever speak English'

*ahora [entre la] gente de edá aquí no se jaya ehpañol* 'now there are no Spanish (speakers) among the older people here'

*ello hicieron lo gente que murieron de allá salí ya de Caura y viví aquí* 'they made the people who died (lived?) there leave Caura and live here'  
*[sí] uté tiene castaño, uté puede comiendo [comerlos]* 'if you have chestnuts, you can eat them'.

#### *Use of tener with existential force*

This usage, common in Brazilian Portuguese and in Afro-Romance creoles, also occurs spontaneously in some vestigial Spanish dialects (Lipski 1985b). *Bozal* texts occasionally exemplify this usage, which has been included in some monogenetic accounts. Existential use of *tener* is not unusual in Trinidad Spanish, but may reflect creole English 'dey have' or 'it have' for 'there is/are' or creole French *tini* (Thomas 1869), since a majority of the Spanish speakers in the corpus also speak *patois*:

*cuando tiene mango aquí tú no puede cargá ehto* 'when there are mangoes here, you can't carry them all'

*Aquí tenía indio, cuando vivía Ma Luí* 'there were Indians here when Ma Luis was still alive'

*tenía bahtante 'bitación de fruta* 'there were a lot of fruit orchards'

*ya tiene bien poco trabajo* 'now there are few jobs'

*ahí tiene una molina [un molino]* 'there is a mill there'

*ahora no tiene na ma* 'now there's no more left'

*en Carami tenía caña y los indios trabajaba[n]* 'in Carami there was sugar cane, and the Indians worked'.

#### *Elimination of articles*

Such usage is common in foreigner talk, vestigial language and among Romance-based creoles, in contrast with normally categorical usage by fluent native speakers of even the most isolated or nonstandard dialects. In *bozal* texts, elimination of articles is quite frequent. The proportion of dropped articles in fluent Trinidad Spanish is higher than in any other known Spanish dialect, and hints at earlier stages when article loss was quasi-categorical:

*[la] crihtofina cogió [el] puehto del cacao* 'cristofina took the place of cacao'

*[la] lapa é como un cochino* 'a lapa is like a pig'

*quería rompé esa casa pa jacé [una] casa nueva* 'he wanted to knock down that house to build a new house'

*si yo encuentro [una] persona [que] habla ehpañol* 'if I meet someone who speaks Spanish'

*el camino que llama [la] cohta norte* 'the highway called the north coast'  
*tiene velo [una vela] en su mano derecho* 'he has a candle in his right hand'  
*en [la] ehcuela ahora, hablan la [el] lenguaje* 'in school now they speak  
 the (English) language'  
*ante la gente comía de [del] conuco* 'before, people ate the food they pro-  
 duced on their *conucos* [plots of land]'

*Use of redundant subject pronouns*

The use of redundant subject pronouns, particularly *yo*, *tú* and *nosotros* is never strictly ungrammatical in Spanish, but categorical use of overt pronouns is not characteristic of fluent native speakers of any dialect. A Spanish speaker who uses overt subject pronouns on most occasions, who uses coreferential subject pronouns two or more times in the same sentence, or who employs two or more noncoreferential 3rd person pronouns in the same sentence does not fit the pattern of a fluent native speaker. In creole dialects, on the other hand, use of overt pronouns compensates for unstable or nonexistent verbal inflection, and use of overt subject pronouns is obligatory in all Romance-based creoles. Trinidad speakers of all levels of fluency use overt subject pronouns at a rate and in combinations which are not found in other fully fluent varieties of Spanish, which may well signify a carryover of *bozal* patterns, in which overt subject pronouns would compensate for unstable or nonexistent verb conjugation:

*Cuando ello hablo [hablan], ello comprenden* 'when they speak, they understand'

*Yo comprendo y yo jablo* 'I understand and I speak'

*El tiene el cuatro y él juga [toca] y él canta* 'He has a cuatro and he plays and he sings'

*Elloh quieren el velso que ello hacen ahora* 'they like the verses that they are writing now'

*cuando yo vine de Caura, yo vine aquí* 'when I came from Caura, I came here'

*cuando él s'iba a trabajá, él pasaba por una puelta* 'when he went to work, he passed through a door'

*nosotro no podemos habla lenguaje muy bueno, pero nosotro podemos comprendé* 'we can't speak (Spanish) very well, but we can understand'

*yo no me acueldo cuanto yo tengo* 'I can't remember how (old) I am'

*yo me orvidé de cuando yo vine* 'I forgot when I arrived'

*depué que ello llegaron ello se coltaron el cabello* 'after they arrived they cut off their hair'

*uhté dice al papa que uhté guhta dea* 'you tell her father that you like her'

*uté tiene dolol de cabeza uté se amarra esa hoja a la cabeza* 'if you have a headache, you tie these leaves around your head'

*uté saben lo que uté quieren, y lo que uté tan buhcando* 'you know what you want and what you are looking for'.

*Phonological wrong division/non-etymological segments*

Afro-Romance creoles frequently exemplify wrong division, in which a consonant which normally occurs word-finally or through linking is attached to the beginning of a word. Creole French dialects abound in examples like *zozo/zoizeau* < *oiseau* 'bird', *zami* < *ami* 'friend', etc. Nonstandard Spanish worldwide (including Trinidad Spanish) has *dir* < *ir* 'to go', while earlier *bozal* Spanish show cases like *sijo* < *hijo* 'son' and *sojo* < *ojo* 'eye'. Among contemporary Caribbean dialects, in which syllable- and word-final /s/ is frequently lost (this includes the Trinidad dialect), nonetymological insertion of /s/ is a common form of hyper-correction (cf. Núñez Cedeño 1986, 1988). Most speakers of Trinidad Spanish routinely exhibit wrong division and insertion of non-etymological /s/. This in itself does not constitute evidence of *bozal* carryovers, but in conjunction with other combinations found in *bozal* texts and in contemporary creoles, the large number of words which have undergone phonological restructuring adds support to the Afro-Hispanic connection:

*tengo como nuevas año no hablá ehpañol* 'it's been about nine years since I have spoken Spanish'

*yo tiene cuatros helmano* 'I have four brothers and sisters'

*ahora no tienen nas ma* [*nada mas*] 'now they have no more'

*a las uno y medio* 'at 1:30'

*diez años asina o veintes año* 'about 10 or 20 years ago'

*loh Caribe son loh propio ihraelista* 'the Caribs are the true Israelites'

*yo tengo una sermana* [*hermana*] *aquí* 'I have a sister here'

*quieren la agua que zentra* [*que el agua entre*] *aquí* 'they want the water to pass through here'

*yo lo puedo comprehend muchos ma* 'I can understand much better'.

COMPARISONS WITH EARLIER *BOZAL* TEXTS*Similarities between Trinidad Spanish and earlier bozal Spanish*

There are numerous similarities, as well as significant differences. The principle points of convergence involve instability of inflection (number, gender, verbal inflection), of prepositions, pronouns and the reduction of syntactic complexity. The majority of *bozal* texts from Latin America exhibit characteristics identical to those just given for Trinidad Spanish. A typical non-literary *bozal* example, coming from Cuba in the early 20th century, is (Cabrera 1979:17):

*Yo va sé uté lo criollo cuento de mi tiela, pero que no son cuento. Eso son vedá po Dió Santo Bindito y si no son vedá, Mama Punga me condene. Cuando ley Mechó contendia con ley inglés, né ta sentao en su trono y visa que baco inglés ta la bahía. Ley Mechó manda bucá Generá en Jefe. Viene Jefe artillero. Jefe artillero trae alifante grandísimo como montaña. Pone cañón riba alifante. Mete piera, mete yero, metralla, tó, tó que encuentra, tó dentro metió cañón. Acaba y va cogé punterío cuala inglés.*

[I am going to tell you local people some stories from my land, but they are not stories. They are true, by God, and if they are not true, may I be damned. When King Melchor was fighting the English king, he was sitting on his throne and he saw that the English ships were in the bay. King Melchor sent for his chief general. The chief artillery came. The artillery chief brought elephants as big as mountains. He put cannons on top of the elephants. He put rocks, he put iron, he put everything he found into the cannons. Then when he was finished he started firing against the English.]

All of the divergences from fully fluent Spanish (including nonstandard but occurring variants) which occur in Trinidad Spanish are also found routinely in *bozal* texts. The discrepancies occur in the opposite direction, where certain recurring *bozal* features are pointedly absent in Trinidad Spanish.

*Lack of aspectual particles such as ta*

This construction is only attested in Cuban and Puerto Rican *bozal* Spanish, of the 19th century, and may well stem from contact with Papiamentu-speaking laborers transferred from Curaçao to aid in plantation agriculture in the 19th century Caribbean. A few marginal cases of *ta* appear in Dominican folk poetry attempting to portray the deficient Spanish spoken by Haitians, where it may stand for the Haitian creole aspectual particles *te* (past/perfective) or *ta* (conditional) as misinterpreted by Spanish speakers. There is no evidence that Spanish creole forms based on *ta* ever

existed in Trinidad; in particular significant numbers of Papiamentu speakers never arrived in distant Trinidad (as they did, for example in neighboring areas of Venezuela, where some are found today, and where there may have been influence on earlier Venezuelan *bozal* and Afro-Hispanic language). The lack of the particle *ta* in Trinidad is in itself not decisive for Afro-Hispanic theories, since this particle does not survive in other areas where it once appeared. However, Trinidad Spanish may be added to the list of regions exhibiting Afro-Hispanic speech but for which no use of *ta* is attested.

### *Lack of the pronoun vos*

This pronoun appears in nearly all Lusitanian creoles, in Africa and Asia; it also figures prominently in Colombian Palenquero and Papiamentu, and occurs occasionally in 19th century Caribbean *bozal* texts. In *bozal* texts which do not give evidence of stable creole features such as those of Papiamentu, *vos* does not occur, unless set against the background of a regional dialect of Spanish (such as that of Buenos Aires and Montevideo) where *vos* is in general use among the entire population. As with the case of *ta*, the absence of *vos* in Afro-Hispanic vestiges in Trinidad Spanish weakens but does not discredit claims that *vos* was once widespread in all Afro-Hispanic dialects.

### *Lack of subject pronouns used as possessives or plural markers*

A few sporadic examples in Trinidad Spanish appear to demonstrate subject pronouns used as possessives (e.g. *la sarga é bueno pa uté cabeza*), but there is no indication that such usage was ever widespread. Given that both creole English and creole French as brought to Trinidad use subject pronouns as possessives, the lack of such combinations in any variety of Trinidad Spanish strongly suggests that no variety of Afro-Hispanic language in Trinidad made use of polyvalent subject pronouns.

### *Lack of widespread pronominal neutralization*

Trinidad Spanish shows no evidence of disjunctive object pronouns (e.g. *mi*) used as subject, nor of subject pronouns used as objects, with the exception of combinations such as *para yo*, *a yo*, etc., frequent in nonstandard Spanish worldwide. Pronominal neutralization appears in *bozal* texts principally in Golden Age Spain, in a direct carryover from peninsular 15th-16th century *bozal* Portuguese (Lipski 1987a). In Latin

America, pronominal neutralization occurred in Palenquero and Papiamento, which are stable and well-established creoles, but is rarely attested in Spanish *bozal* texts.

### *Lack of lan/lon/nan*

A curious item which appears in *bozal* texts from the Spanish Golden Age, and which reappears in 19th century *bozal* specimens from throughout Latin America, is the portmanteau item *lan/lon/nan* (for sources, cf. Lipski 1987c):

[Cuba and Puerto Rico]

*me garra po nan pasa* 'he grabs me by the [curly] hair'

*nan cañón hacía ipum!* 'the cannon went boom!'

*ma que lan tiempo si piere* 'even if the time is wasted'

*cuando lan galla canta* 'when the roosters crow'

*nunca se quita nan so* 'I never get out of the sun'

[Spanish Golden Age] *Sor Juana Inés*

*a lan Dioso que sa yoranda* 'to God who is crying' (1678).

Although Alvarez Nazario (1974:176) hypothesizes that this item derives from an African third person plural pronoun (perhaps reflected in Papiamento *nan*), *lan/lon/nan* as used in *bozal* Spanish is almost invariably used as a definite article, singular or plural, and never as a pronoun. Unlike the elements mentioned earlier, *lan/lon/nan* does not converge with Papiamento, Palenquero and Afro-Lusitanian creoles, but this polymorphic item recurs throughout the Caribbean and also in Argentina and Uruguay. There are no attestations of *lan/lon/nan* in Trinidad Spanish, although given its disappearance from all contemporary forms of Spanish, this does not necessarily preclude its existence in 19th century Trinidad.

On the positive side of the balance, Trinidad Spanish shares general characteristics of *bozal* texts which reflect imperfect learning, confusion of morphological inflection, false etymology and improvised circumlocutions. None of these items points unequivocally to a uniform *bozal* pan-American dialect and they do not constitute critical evidence in favor of monogenetic creole theories.

### CONCLUSIONS

Trinidad Spanish provides another link in the reconstruction of earlier stages of Afro-Hispanic language in the Caribbean. Although Trinidad

Spanish exhibits nonstandard characteristics, as well as creoloid forms resulting from the gradual erosion, there is little convergence with demonstrably related creoles such as Palenquero and Papiamentu. This suggests considerably less homogeneity of Afro-Hispanic language across Spanish America than is presupposed by monogenetic or 'pan-American' creole theories.

While the number of African slaves held by Spanish speakers in Trinidad was always quite small in comparison with neighboring countries, Africans and their descendents were exposed to creole French even before the end of the Spanish occupation, and many eventually learned creole English as well. Given the similarity of key structures between creole French and attested Afro-Iberian creoles (including putative pan-American *bozal* Spanish), if creoloid structures were already present in Trinidad *bozal* Spanish, subsequent contact with creole French would be expected to reinforce and extend these constructions. That this has not occurred weakens claims regarding inevitable relexification of existent creoles, and suggests that Spanish as spoken by Africans in Trinidad passed from an unstable pidgin to a stable nonstandard but noncreolized dialect of Spanish, even in the absence of large communities of Spanish speakers.

#### NOTES

1. For variants of this theory, including both support and criticism, cf. Alvarez Nazario (1974), Granda (1968, 1972, 1978), Hancock (1975), Laurence (1974), Lipski (1986a, 1986b, 1987a, 1987b), López Morales (1980), Megenney (1984, 1985), Naro (1978), Otheguy (1975), Perl (1982, 1984, 1985), Taylor (1971), Whinnom (1965).

2. Cf. Lipski (1987b). In these key *bozal* texts, it is not possible to rule out the possible direct influence of Papiamentu on Caribbean *bozal* Spanish, via the introduction of slaves and contract laborers from Curaçao when the sugar plantation boom of the early 19th century necessitated the massive importation of thousands of new workers. Evidence exists that Papiamentu was spoken by the *gente de Corsou* in Cuba and Puerto Rico during part of the 19th century, and Papiamentu forms appear in *bozal* texts from those countries (Alvarez Nazario 1970, 1974: 146, Bachiller y Morales 1883, Granda 1973, Lipski 1987b). Similar although less definitive evidence also exists for *bozal* Spanish from Venezuela (Aretz and Ramón y Rivera 1955), where communities of escaped slaves from Curaçao mixed with *cimarrones* in Venezuela at an early time period, and possibly gave rise to a high level of linguistic transference. In particular the *ta* +  $V_{inf}$  constructions used as evidence in many monogenetic Afro-Hispanic creole theories appear to be direct transfers from Papiamentu, or at the very least to be greatly facilitated by Spanish-Papiamentu contacts.

3. For initial data on Trinidad Spanish, cf. Thompson (1957), Moodie (1970, 1973, 1982, 1986, forthcoming), Laurence (1970, 1974), Richards (1966, 1970).



4. The following remarks are based on a corpus of tape recorded materials, collected by Prof. Sylvia Moodie and by myself, and representing the last generation of Trinidad Spanish speakers. My field research in Trinidad (in 1984-5) was greatly facilitated by the generous and energetic assistance of Prof. Moodie, whose collaboration I gratefully acknowledge. The combined corpus contains nearly 100 hours of recorded material, by speakers of all levels of fluency, of Caucasian, Amerindian and African descent. For the present remarks, cited examples were produced by Afro-Americans fluent in Spanish. However, given the vestigial nature of Trinidad Spanish, as described above, it is likely that some of the occurring forms represent a diminished level of fluency in Spanish, as compared with earlier, monolingual, generations.

5. In fact, the vestigial nature of Trinidad Spanish has been implicated in accounting for similarities with many known creoles; cf. Lipski (1985b).

## REFERENCES

ALVAREZ NAZARIO, MANUEL, 1970. Un texto literario del papiamento documentado en Puerto Rico en 1830. *Revista del Instituto de Cultura Puertorriqueña* 47:9-20.

———, 1974. *El elemento afronegroide en el español de Puerto Rico*. San Juan, Instituto de Cultura Puertorriqueña.

ANTHONY, MICHAEL, 1974. *Glimpses of Trinidad and Tobago*. Port of Spain, Columbus Publishers.

———, 1985. *First in Trinidad*. Port of Spain, Circle Press.

ARETZ DE RAMÓN Y RIVERA, ISABEL and LUIS FELIPE RAMÓN Y RIVERA, 1955. Resumen de un estudio sobre las expresiones negras en el folklore musical y coreográfico de Venezuela. *Archivos Venezolanos de Folklore* 3(4):65-73.

BACHILLER Y MORALES, ANTONIO, 1883. Desfiguración a que está expuesto el idioma castellano al contacto y mezcla de razas. *Revista de Cuba* 14: 97-104.

BLACK, JAN KNIPPERS; HOWARD BLUTSTEIN, KATHRYN JOHNSTON, DAVID McMORRIS, 1976. *Area handbook for Trinidad and Tobago*. Washington, U.S. Government Printing Office.

BRERETON, BRIDGET, 1979. *Race relations in colonial Trinidad 1870-1900*. Cambridge, Cambridge University.

———, 1981. *A history of modern Trinidad, 1783-1962*. Kingston, Heinemann.

FRASER, LIONEL, 1891. *History of Trinidad*. Port of Spain, Government Printing Office.

GRANDA, GERMÁN DE, 1968. La tipología 'criollo' de dos hablas del área lingüística hispánica. *Thesaurus* 23:193-205.

———, 1972. Estructuras lingüísticas y relación genética en un habla 'criolla' de Hispanoamérica. *Filología* 16:119-33.

———, 1973. Papiamento en Hispanoamérica (siglos XVII-XIX). *Thesaurus* 28:1-13.

———, 1978. *Estudios lingüísticos hispánicos, afrohispanicos y criollos*. Madrid, Gredos.

HANCOCK, IAN, 1975. Malacca creole Portuguese: Asian, African or European? *Anthropological Linguistics* 17:211-36.

JOSEPH, E.L., 1838. *History of Trinidad*. London, A.K. Newman & Co.

LAURENCE, KEMLIN, 1970. Spanish in Trinidad: the survival of a minority language in a multilingual society. Ph.D. dissertation, University of London.

———, 1974. Is Caribbean Spanish a case of decreolization? *Orbis* 23:484-99.

LIPSKI, JOHN, 1985a. Black Spanish: the last frontier of Afro-America. *Crítica* 1(2): 53-75.

———, 1985b. Creole Spanish and vestigial Spanish: evolutionary parallels. *Linguistics* 23:963-84.

———, 1986a. On the loss of /s/ in "black" Spanish. *Neophilologus* 70: 208-16.

———, 1986b. Golden Age 'black Spanish': existence and coexistence. *Afro-Hispanic Review* 5(1-2):7-12.

———, 1987a. *Bozal* Spanish: existence and coexistence. *Journal of Pidgin and Creole Languages* 2:171-203.

———, 1987b. On the construction *ta* + infinitive in Caribbean *bozal* Spanish. *Romance Philology* 40:431-50.

———, 1987c. On the origin and use of *lan/nan* in Caribbean *bozal* Spanish. *Beitraege zur romanischen Philologie* 24:281-90.

LÓPEZ MORALES, HUMBERTO, 1980. Sobre la pretendida existencia y pervivencia del 'criollo' cubano. *Anuario de Letras* 18:85-116.

MACDONALD, SCOTT, 1986. *Trinidad and Tobago: democracy and development in the Caribbean*. New York, Praeger.

MAGID, ALVIN, 1988. *Urban nationalism: a study of political development in Trinidad*. Gainesville, University Presses of Florida.

MEGENNEY, WILLIAM, 1984. Traces of Portuguese in three Caribbean creoles: evidence in support of the monogenetic theory. *Hispanic Linguistics* 1: 177-90.

———, 1985. La influencia criolla-portuguesa en el español caribeño. *Anuario de Lingüística Hispánica* (Valladolid) 1:157-80.

———, 1988. Black rural speech in Venezuela. *Neophilologus* 73:52-61.

MOHAN, PEGGY and PAUL ZADOR, 1986. Discontinuity in a life cycle: the death of Trinidad Bhojpuri. *Language* 62:291-319.

MOODIE, SYLVIA, 1970a. El español hablado en la isla de Trinidad. Ph.D. thesis, Universidad Complutense, Madrid.

———, 1970b. Canciones tradicionales en la isla de Trinidad. *Revista de Dialectología y Tradiciones Populares* 26:323-61.

———, 1973. The Spanish language as spoken in Trinidad. *Caribbean Studies* 13:88-94.

———, 1982. Trinidad Spanish pronouns: a case of language death in the Caribbean. In Rose Nash and D. Belaval (eds.), *Readings in Spanish-English contrastive linguistics*. San Juan, Inter-American University, pp. 206-28.

———, 1986. El español de Trinidad: variabilidad y desgaste articulatorio. *Anuario de Lingüística Hispánica* (Valladolid) 2:177-96.

———, forthcoming. Morphophonemic illformedness in an obsolescent dialect: a case study of Trinidad Spanish. *Orbis*.

NARO, ANTHONY, 1978. A study on the origins of pidginization. *Language* 54:314-47.

NEWSON, LINDA, 1976. *Aboriginal and Spanish colonial Trinidad*. Orlando, Academic Press.

NOEL, JESSE, 1972. *Trinidad, provincia de Venezuela*. Caracas, Biblioteca de la Academia Nacional de la Historia.

NÚÑEZ CEDEÑO, RAFAEL, 1986. La /s/ ultracorrectiva en dominicano y la estructura silábica. In José Moreno de Alba (ed.), *Actas del II congreso internacional sobre el español de América*. Mexico, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, pp. 337-47.

———, 1988. Structure-preserving properties of an epenthetic rule in Spanish. In David Birdsong, Jean-Pierre Montreuil (eds.), *Advances in Romance linguistics*. Dordrecht, Foris, pp. 319-35.

O'CONNOR, P.E.T., 1978. *Some Trinidad yesterdays*. Port of Spain, Inprint Caribbean Ltd.

OTHEGUY, RICARDO, 1975. The Spanish Caribbean: a creole perspective. In Charles-James Bailey, Roger Shuy (eds.), *New Ways of Analyzing Variation in English*. Washington, Georgetown University, pp. 323-39.

OTTLEY, CARLTON, 1971. *Spanish Trinidad*. Port of Spain, Longman Caribbean, 2nd ed.

OXAAAL, IVAR, 1982. *Black intellectuals and the dilemmas of race and class in Trinidad*. Cambridge, Schenkman.

PÉREZ APARICIO, JOSEFINA, 1966. *Pérdida de la isla de Trinidad*. Sevilla, Escuela de Estudios Hispano-Americanos.

PERL, MATTHIAS, 1982. Creole morphosyntax in the Cuban 'habla bozal'. *Studii si Cercetari Lingvistice* 5: 424-33.

———, 1984. La estructuras de comunicación de los esclavos negros en Cuba en el siglo XIX. *Islas* 77: 43-59.

———, 1985. El fenómeno de descriollización del 'habla bozal' y el lenguaje coloquial de la variante cubana del español. *Anuario de Lingüística Hispanica* (Valladolid) 1:191-202.

RICHARDS, HENRY, 1966. Some vestiges of Spanish in the dialect of Trinidad. *Hispania* 49:481-83.

———, 1970. Some Spanish words in the English-based dialect of Trinidad. *Hispania* 53:263-66.

TAYLOR, DOUGLAS, 1971. Grammatical and lexical affinities of creoles. In Dell Hymes (ed.), *Pidginization and creolization of languages*. Cambridge, Cambridge University, pp. 293-96.

THOMAS, J.J., 1869. *The theory and practice of creole grammar*. Port of Spain, The Chronicle Publishing Office.

THOMPSON, ROBERT, 1957. A preliminary survey of the Spanish dialect of Trinidad. *Orbis* 6:353-72.

WHINOM, KEITH, 1965. Origin of European-based creoles and pidgins. *Orbis* 14:510-27.

JOHN M. LIPSKI

Department of Romance Languages and Literatures

University of Florida

Gainesville, FL 32611, U.S.A.

LORNA McDANIEL

THE FLYING AFRICANS:  
EXTENT AND STRENGTH OF THE MYTH IN THE AMERICAS

The theme of human aerial flight permeates the mythology of Black America. Examples of the metaphor are found in major musical genres, myths and poetry in Black cultures that span the Caribbean and southern North America, embracing generations to testify to the depth of the cosmological and conscious projection of systems of flight escape and homeland return. While the theme of human flight does not occur in any significant proportion in West African mythology related themes of transformation and pursuit do appear. However, in African thought, witches and spirits possess the power of flight; a flight that can be blocked by the use of salt. The belief in spirit flight, ubiquitous in the Black diaspora of the New World, parallels that in African thought, but in the New World it is enlarged to include humans as possessors of the capability of flight.

In the Haitian tale, "Pierre Jean's tortoise" (Courlander 1964:29), birds present the tortoise with feathers, but at the moment of danger, retrieve them, leaving the tortoise to sing: "If I could fly, ehe, What a tragedy, I have no wings." The South Carolinian story, "All God's children had wings" (Hughes 1958:62) repeats the notion of the repeal of the power of flight. The story begins: "Once all Africans could fly like birds"; the gift of flight was repealed, but freedom and escape through the ability to fly is again awarded the besieged slaves who soar above the slavers' heads accompanied by their own singing. In both stories song or magical words precipitate or accompany freedom and in the several variants of the myth (Georgia Writers Project 1940:150, 116, 117), where song is not employed, code words facilitate flight. The most recent published retelling of the story forms the title piece of a children's book of African/American

tales called *The people could fly* by Virginia Hamilton.

One can find thousands of variants throughout the Caribbean among older folk who know the myth, tale or story (that I call "The flying Africans") and who express the actualization of flight with conviction. Ritual songs use the same metaphor of homeland return though expressed in recondite language. On Curaçao the following Makamba song, translated from Papiamentu by Frank Martinus, is supposedly sung by a captured African who bids farewell to his friends as they rise from the ground:

I am in trouble  
I am in trouble, man  
I am in trouble  
If you see god  
Give my compliments to him.

(Martinus 1988)

Richard Price, in *First-Time*, documents many beautiful and ancient histories of the Saramacan past. Among these is the following:

...he could walk in a wink from here to the river ..., and walk right across it as if it were solid ground. ...They say that Vuma could fly like a bird. But he was a human being. He'd prepare the *obia* till it was just right, push the ring onto the tip of his thumb, *suuu*, like this (motions). That's what let him walk on water. Well, his parrot feather, specially prepared. He'd tie his belt like this- *saaa*. And he'd fly, *vauu piiit!* ...

(Price 1983:112)

The story above uncovers the use of charms like the ring and feather to conjure flight. In Guiana the people say that the old Africans would simply put themselves into a hollowed out gourd (*gobi*), put the cover in place and fly back to Africa (Liverpool 1988). A similar belief is recorded by Miguel Barnet in his edition of the autobiography of Esteban Montejo, an ex-slave in Cuba: "...what happened was that their spirits left their bodies and wandered about over the sea and through space, like when a snail leaves its shell and goes into another and then another and another" (Montejo 1968:131). Some stories describe the aviators with corn cobs tucked under their armpits (Elder 1988) while others recount their spinning around to induce flight. Tobago poet Eric Roach dramatizes the magical journey of Canga Brown, "a man turn soucouyan", who flew in a ball of fire (Roach 1955).

Each mode of travel projects, in a structural way, a cultural and personal system of flight. Whether the Africans rode in a calabash, floated in a sea shell or on a leaf, soared on a wing, on the back of a bird or simply walked upon the water, they had to overcome the sea. The sea (or a body

of water) represents the obstacle against return and is used as the symbol of deterrence in much of the lore presented here. The following slave era song from Carriacou, Grenada, overtly acknowledges homeland longing and the barrier to return – the sea. The song appropriately belongs to the Bongo dance type, traditionally associated with death observances in Caribbean African-type dance rituals (McDaniel 1986:101). The language is French Creole.

Oyo, Mama, Bel Louise oh  
 Nu kai alé nâ gini pu  
 kotwè pawâ mwè  
 lame bawé mwè

We shall go to Africa to meet  
 my parents  
 The sea bars me

(Pearse 1956:5)

“The Flying Africans” myth is also perpetuated in Jamaica and documented by Zora Neale Hurston in this way:

...salt is not given because it is heavy. It holds duppies (spirits) to the ground. He can not fly and departs if he has salt. Once Africans could all fly because they never ate salt. Many of them were brought to Jamaica to be slaves, but they never were slaves. They flew back to Africa. Those who ate salt had to stay in Jamaica and be slaves, because they were too heavy to fly.

(Hurston 1938:62)

#### SALT AS SYMBOL

The item above introduces a significant theme that merges with and extends the significance of the sea symbol. Salt, like the watery saline barrier, blocks flight. Just as people intent upon return abstain from the ingestion of salt so also do spirits and witches avoid salt. The use of salt as a protective agent against flying witches is found in the folklore throughout the southern part of the United States as well as in the Caribbean; and in West Africa too, similar patterns of belief exist. “...the witch leaves her skin behind on going out, and among the Vais it is thought that salt and pepper sprinkled in the room will prevent her from getting back into her hide” (Puckett 1926:155). It is reported that during the 1920s in Nigeria people thought that malevolent spirits of sleeping humans prowled during the night and would succumb at the presence of salt and be annihilated, not being able to reinhabit the body (Da Costa 1984). This belief is mirrored in the folk

thought of Carriacou that embraces the idea that the flying monsters, the *lougrou* and *soucouyan*, who shed their skin outdoors, can be apprehended by spreading salt. Salt obstructs the reentry of their spirits into the covering. Grains of sand from the fine-sanded neighbor island, Sandy Island, may also be scattered on the door-step for the sand deters the witch that must count every grain before its exit. Other Caribbean cultures retain similar folk beliefs with only minor variations exhibiting belief/practices too wide-spread to have been invented in isolated areas (Puckett 1926:155).

On West Coast Africa in the Sudanic and Saharan regions, salt, gold and cola nuts were major pre-colonial trade commodities and from those early times the significance of salt was most likely imbued with symbolic strength. Salt was a precious item whose weight was at times exchanged equally for gold.

One can easily perceive the New World extension of the salt metaphor in African legends and in history where the distasteful, salty and death-laden Atlantic Passage could have logically reinforced the association of salt with death and the spirit world. The sea is the physical barrier and salt, in its association with the sea, also inhibits return, but in an alternative way. It is the abstinence from salt that could permit flight or "confer special powers like those of witches..." or even make one "powerful enough to fly back to Africa" (Schuler 1980:96). Food in the 18th century Caribbean was preserved in the sea-like brine and reeked of the infamous salt. Weekly allowances of salted codfish, mackerel, herring or pork constituted the new and foreign food culture of the enslaved that was dictated by the Beneficent Clauses of the Code Noir and British slave laws. No doubt the acceptance of salted food implied to the slave the acceptance of bondage from which he could not "fly".

The significance of salt permeates African-type religious ritual throughout the Caribbean as an ingredient abhorrent to the spirit world. In modern ceremonies perpetuated throughout the Caribbean that are staged in honor of ancestral memory, salt is withheld from the food cooked in honor of the *old parents*.

Victor Turner (1967:30) suggests that symbols may operate on several levels and in polarized dimensions, being at once, "sensory" (affective, easily recognized, and physiological) and at the same time "ideological" (stressing a larger societal value). The physiological connotation of heaviness and groundedness is easily recognized in the physical effect of salt on the body, while the cultural and mythological meanings are less evident and more difficult to discern. However, in the social ownership of the symbols the multiple and sometimes conflicting metaphors mingle, being



accepted by some on its sensory and by others on its ideological level. The sensory explanation of magical power is offered by Eric Roach in the same poem introduced above, "The Ballad of Canga Brown".

What give Canga Brown that power?  
He don't eat salt nor sugar,  
His flesh like Ibo yam,  
His blood like clean rain water".

(Roach 1955)

### THE IGBO TALE

"The Flying Africans" myth/tale as a whole, granting a polarization of meaning, alludes not only to the imagination of supernatural power and the soul's return from exile, but also to the ideological choice of suicide that was often made by enslaved Africans. This logical and defiant act of rebellion actualized the return to Africa. The Igbo most often made that choice for, as it was reasoned, he suffered from a state termed "fixed melancholy". Eighteenth century literature describes the Igbo as having a

...timidity and despondency of mind;" and a "depression of spirits... (it) gives them an air of softness and submission, ...which (causes) them frequently to seek, in a voluntary death, a refuge from their melancholy reflections. (Edwards 1794:76)

Igbos, coming from a highly individualistic society were probably extremely perplexed at their condition under slavery, and being assured that they would consummate their existential notion of the inseparability of their culturally essential brotherhood, could not conceive of not rejoining their families at death. These notions are expressed in contemporary culture in several ways. For instance, the Igbo mythological involvement with flight centers upon the eagle (*ogu*) that flies without intermittent perchings to its destination. The feathers and eggs of the *ogu* operate in Igbo culture as metaphors of light, beauty and excellence and these feathers help celebrate the Igbo ordination of the chief (Nwukah 1984).

A Georgian variant of "The flying Africans" called "The Igbo landing" (Georgia Writers' Project 1940:150) recreates an incident involving a group of Igbos who walked singing into the water at Dunbar Creek, Georgia. The suicide site is named Igbo Landing and the myth now transforms itself into a historical tale. The story below is told by a Georgian culture bearer who interprets the action literally and does not perceive the intent of return by suicide in the "march to Africa":

Heahd bout duh Ibo Landing? Das duh place weah dey bring duh Ibos obuh in a slabe ship an wen dey git death, dey ain lak it an so dey all staht singin and dey mahch right down in duh ribbah tuh mahch back tuh Africa, but dey ain able tuh get deah. Dey gits drown.  
(Georgia Writers' Project 1940:185)

The themes of water and song that surround flight in oral literature repeat themselves in several contemporary songs, poems and novels by Caribbean writers like Joseph Zobel, the author of *la Rue Casse-Nègres* (Sugar Cane Alley); but Black American female writers especially underpin their new literature with this rich material from the past. In the novel, *Praisesong for the widow*, Paule Marshall incorporates the same historical tale of mass suicide by drowning. Her segment on the "Igbo landing" recaptures the unified act as one of indomitable spirituality.

...they turned ...and looked at the white folks what brought 'em here. Took their time again and gived them the same long look. ...and walked on back to the edge of the river here. ...They just kept walking right on out over the river. Now you wouldna thought they'd of got very far seeing as it was water they was walking on. Besides they has all that iron on 'em. Iron on they ankles and they wrists and fastened 'round they necks like a dog collar.  
...And chains hooking up the iron. But chains didn't stop those Igbos none. Neither iron. ...they just kept on walking like the water was solid ground. And they was singing by then ...When they realized there wasn't nothing between them and home but some water and that wasn't giving 'em no trouble they got so tickled they started in to singing...  
(Marshall 1983:39)

Also retaining the profound symbols of water and song in *Song of Solomon*, novelist Toni Morrison recounts another tale of a young man's suicide, in which he, in imitation of his great grandfather, leaps to prove that "If you surrendered to the air, you could ride it" (Morrison 1977:337). Besides Marshall and Morrison several contemporary Black female novelists, that include Maryse Condé, Jamaica Kincaid and Toni Cade Bambara, allude to mystical corporal displacement or integrate the complete tale of the Flying Africans in culturally telling ways.

#### FLIGHT IN BLACK SONG

Like the myth, folk tale, historical narrative and the modern novel, Black American song is filled with references to flight. The blues, more than any other song genre, projects the veiled but common metaphor of physical flight in the recurrent train imagery to represent social escape (Chartres

1963:70). Especially in the male-owned country blues the texts speak not of suicide, but of running away, fleeing from betrayal and from the terror of a strained and repressive context. Charged with the same message, the Negro Spiritual adapts the Christian vision of the soul's ascent to heaven, of its flight "to Jesus and to rest". There is the widely held notion that some spirituals, though religious in practice, held a double function as signal songs of slave escape. Items like "Steal away" and "Follow the drinking gourd" are thought to have been used secretly and with alternative meanings to alert and direct the bands of enslaved people in escape plots (Southern 1983:144). Though I do not suggest that "All God's children got wings", "If I had the wings of a dove", "If I had two wings", "Motherless child", "Now let me fly", were used as "alerting" songs, they all contain the structural depictions of flight. Selected verses of these Negro Spirituals and favorite hymns sung in Black churches (including one from the Trinidad Spiritual Baptist repertoire) are presented below.

*Lend me your wings*

Lend me your wings

*Let me fly to glory*

Blessed are the pure in heart

(Trinidad Spiritual Baptist "Trumpet" song)

*Motherless child*

Sometimes I feel like a motherless child,

Sometimes I feel like a motherless child,

Sometimes I feel like a motherless child,

A long way from home,

A long way from home.

Sometimes I feel like a feather in the air,

Sometimes I feel like a feather in the air,

Sometimes I feel like a feather in the air,

*And spread my wings and fly,*

And I spread my wings and fly.

(Hughes 1958:290)

*Now let me fly*

Way down yonder in de middle o' de fiel',

Angel workin' at the chariot wheel,

Not so partic'lar 'bout workin' at de wheel,

But jes' want-a see how de chariot feel.

*Now let me fly*

Now let me fly,

Now let me fly,  
Into Mount Zion, Lord, Lord.

(Hughes 1958:301)

*You may bury me in the East*

In that dreadful Judgment day,  
*We'll take wings and fly away*  
For to hear the trumpet  
*Sound-in-a that morning*

(Work 1940:56)

*I'll fly away*

*Some glad morning*  
When this life is over  
I'll fly away  
Like a bird  
From prison bars has flown  
*I'll fly away*

I'll fly away, oh, glory  
I'll fly away  
Oh, when I die,  
Hallelujah, bye and bye  
I'll fly away

(Brumley 1981:183)

*Two wings*

Lord, I want two wings to veil my face  
*I want two wings to fly away*

(Hayes 1948:41)

*Ev'ry day'll be Sunday*

*One o' these mornin's bright and fair*  
Ev'ry day'll be Sunday  
Bye an' bye  
*Goin' to take my wings an' cleave the air*  
Ev'ry day'll be Sunday bye an' bye

(Work 1940:213)

I have italicized significant flight images in the spirituals: the first commenting on the morning backdrop to the action and the second referring to ascent or the use of wings. The line, "one of these mornings, goin' to take my wings an' cleave the air" contains pictorializations especially essential in South Carolinian thought. The folk imagery and song repertoire of South Carolina was thoroughly researched and incorporated by George and Ira Gershwin, students of South Carolinian folklore. They created the familiar

"Summertime" using sets of images and phrases from Negro Spirituals. The song conforms to the idea of the ascent being a morning event in which wings are employed and where song accompanies flight.

*Summertime*

*One of these morning*

You goin' rise up singing

*Then you'll spread yo' wings*

an you'll take the sky

But till that mornin'

there's a nothin' can harm you

With Daddy and Mammy standin' by

(Heyward and Gershwin 1935:16)

### UNIVERSALITY OF THE THEME

In Robert Hayden's poems, "Middle passage" and "O Daedalus, fly away home" (Hayden 1966:65, 71) the essential themes in Black mythology, water, song, and flight reemerge. Hayden employs European mythology in "O Daedalus, fly away home" to express the universality of homeland longing. In Greek mythology, Daedalus with his son, Icarus, both fixed with wings, escaped prison through flight; but Icarus rode too close to the sun, causing his feathers to fall and like the tortoise from the Haitian myth above, the gift of flight was recalled from Icarus.

Certainly, the vision of flight is a universal quest and the ideas discussed here are not exclusive to Black mythology and thought; we find identical themes and imageries in biblical references, in hymn language and in European folklore. A well-known example of such a parallel is the European folk notion of the vulnerability of the bird to salt. Children are advised to "put salt on his tail and you could capture him".

Myths, cosmological symbolizations and national attitudes were also part of the abducted Africans' ideation and all, not only the Igbo, had to reorganize their thinking in the Americas. As the Africans' thinking became infused with Christian/colonial dogma the new symbols mixed with and in some respects complemented traditional thought. We see in "The flying Africans" myth African symbols reciting the African struggle for freedom in the New World and reflecting Black affect and need. The myth has not escaped the contemporary novelist, song-writer, or anthropologist – nor have the people in the Caribbean forgotten it. They continue to rely upon the magical value and power of flight to explain the unexplainable and rest the logic of disappearances upon this gift. In folk

thought illusive historical heroes like the 18th century Grenadian revolutionary, Julien Fedon, the popular 20th century Trinidad labor leader, Uriah Butler, and the Jamaican orchestrator of the modern Back to Africa movement, Marcus Garvey, possessed mystical powers of flight.

The folktale, "High John de Conquer" recreated by Zora Neale Hurston, projects the mythical hero, John, arriving from Africa "walking the winds" and following the slave ship "like an albatross". John teaches the people to use their power of flight in times of need, but not simply as a physical displacement, but as a mental escape in creativity and personal spirituality. Again the elements of song and water appear along with a reference to morning in this narrative of slave escape. The following is taken from the segment that dramatizes John de Conquer's mobilization of the misused people. The people have complained that they would be detected as absconded slaves if sighted wearing their tattered clothing. John instructs them this way:

"Oh, you got plenty to wear. Just reach inside yourselves and get out all those fine raiments you been toting around with you for the last longest. They is in there, all right, I know. Get 'em out, and put 'em on." ...And then John hollered back for them to get out their musical instruments so they could play music on the way. They were right inside where they got their fine raiments from. ...After that they all heard a big sing of wings. It was John come back, riding on a great black crow. The crow was so big that one wing rested on the morning, while the other dusted off the evening star. John lighted down and helped them, so they all mounted on, and the bird took out straight across the deep blue sea.

(Hurston 1973:546)

The Hurston interpretation adds new dimensions to the escape tale making it very different from Marshall's proud recounting of the historical past of rebellion and Morrison's concentrated integration of the myth. Hurston superimposes a stilted racial perspective in suggesting later in her adaptation, that the mental fantasy of flight and the accompanying search for song are somehow linked to the creative energies of Black people - implying that past atrocities were responsible for more than just Black culture; they were somehow effective in producing a Black "personality" of forbearance infused with "song and laughter".

## CONCLUSION

It is important in reading the several settings of the myth that we allow for double or triple meanings and that we frame the special experience that inspired the secret dreams of revolt and freedom within the slave context. The exact meaning in the several versions of the myth is difficult to ascertain as is a full interpretation of the meanings of the heavenly ascent so often portrayed in the Negro Spiritual. Their meanings extend further than the obvious statements. With this in mind we can see in each of the far flung articulations presented above an underlying connectedness in the historical/cultural imageries of passage and silent diffusions of symbolic statements.

The cultural variations and the wide distribution of the myth/tale, "The flying Africans" declare a common origin and a shared experience. The imagination that bestowed humans with the ability of flight clearly evolved from the desire for freedom and where it is not a myth, but a narrative of resistance, it announces the ultimate act of suicide. The desire for astral flight resounds in the ecstatic motion of dance and music of the Black church and vibrates in the inspired political acts of slave resistance. When discovered in the myth, tale, historical chronicle, or song, and whether interpreted as physical, cosmological or political events, these modes of flight are connected and share the same symbols. The unifying symbols emanate from the Black experience of slavery and recapitulate their meanings in literary forms and songs from various eras and continents.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- BAMBARA, TONI CADE, 1977. *The sea birds are still alive*. New York, Random House.
- BRUMLEY, ALBERT E., 1981. *Songs of Zion*. Nashville, Parthenon Press.
- CHARTRES, SAMUEL, 1963. *Poetry in the blues*. New York, Oak Publication.
- CONDÉ, MARYSE, 1986. *Moi, Tituba Sorciere... Noire de Salem*. Paris, Mercure de France.
- COURLANDER, 1964. "Pierre Jean's tortoise", *The Piece of Fire and Other Haitian Tales*. New York, Harcourt, Brace and World.
- DACOSTA, ADRIAN, 1984. [Personal communication].
- EDWARDS, BRYAN, 1794. *The history, civil and commercial of the British Colonies*. 2 vols., London, John Stockdale.

GEORGIA WRITERS' PROJECT, Savannah Unit, Work Projects Administration, 1940. *Drums and shadows: Survival studies among the Georgia coastal Negroes*. Reprint ed., University of Georgia Press, 1973.

HAMILTON, VIRGINIA, 1986. *The People could fly*. New York, Knopf.

HAYES, ROLAND, 1948. *My songs: Afro-American religious songs*. Boston, Little, Brown.

HUGHES, LANGSTON, and ARNA BONTEMPS, 1958. *The book of Negro folklore*. New York, Dodd, Mead and Company.

HURSTON, ZORA NEALE, 1938. *Tell my horse*. Philadelphia, J.B. Lippincott. Reprint ed., Berkeley, California, Turtle Island, 1983.

——, 1973. "High John de Conquer" in Alan Dundes (ed.), *Mother wit from the laughing barrel*. N.J., Prentice Hall.

KINCAID, JAMAICA, 1986. *Annie John*. New York, New American Library.

LIVERPOOLE, THELMA, 1988. [Personal communication].

MARSHALL, PAULE, 1983. *Praisesong for the widow*. New York, Dutton.

MARTINUS, FRANK, 1988. "Guene: the connection between Papiamentu and Africa". Unpublished paper presented at Creole Roundtable, University of Georgia, Athens, Feb. 1988.

MONTEJO, ESTEBAN, 1968. *The autobiography of a run-away slave*. Ed. Miguel Barnet. New York, Pantheon Books.

MORRISON, TONI, 1977. *Song of Solomon*. New York, Alfred A. Knopf.

NWOKAH, OSITA, 1985. [Personal communication].

PEARSE, ANDREW, 1956. Recording insert. The big drum dance of Carriacou. *Ethnic Folkways Library*, Album No. FE4011.

PRICE, RICHARD, 1983. *First-Time: The historical vision of an Afro-American people*. Baltimore, London, Johns Hopkins University Press.

PUCKETT, NEWBELL NILES, 1926. *Folk beliefs of the Southern Negro*. University of North Carolina Press. Reprint ed., New York, Negro Universities Press, 1968.

ROACH, ERIC, 1955. Ballad of Canga. *Caribbean Quarterly*, vol. 4, no. 2, (December).

SCHULER, MONICA, 1980. *Alas, alas, Kongo: A social history of indentured Africans' immigration into Jamaica, 1841-1865*. Baltimore, London, John Hopkins University Press.

SOUTHERN, EILEEN, 1971. *The music of black Americans*. 2nd edition, New York, London, W.W. Norton, 1983.



TURNER, VICTOR, 1967. *The forest of symbols, aspects of Ndembu ritual*. Ithaca, New York, Cornell University Press.

WORK, JOHN, 1940. *American Negro song and spirituals*. New York, Bonanza Books.

ZOBEL, JOSEPH, 1974. *La Rue Casse-Nègres*. Paris, Presence Africaine.

LORNA MCDANIEL  
2006 Oak Lane Road  
Wilmington, DE 19803  
U.S.A.

## REVIEW ARTICLE

### CUBA NOW

*The Cuba reader: the making of a revolutionary society.* PHILIP BRENNER, WILLIAM M. LEOGRANDE, DONNA RICH, and DANIEL SIEGEL (eds.). New York: Grove Press, 1989. xxxv + 564 pp. (Paper US \$14.95). *Cuba: the test of time.* JEAN STUBBS. London: Latin America Bureau, 1989. xvii + 142 pp. (Paper UK £3.95). *Cuba: politics, economics and society.* MAX AZICRI. London: Pinter Publishers Ltd., 1988. xxiii + 276 pp. (Cloth US \$35.00, Paper US \$12.50). *Cuba libre: breaking the chains?* PETER MARSHALL. Boston: Faber & Faber, 1987. viii + 300 pp. (Cloth US \$18.95). *The closest of enemies: a personal and diplomatic account of U.S.-Cuban relations since 1957.* WAYNE S. SMITH. New York and London: W.W. Norton & Co., 1987. 308 pp. (Paper US \$8.95). *Imperial state and revolution: the United States and Cuba, 1952-1986.* MORRIS H. MORLEY. New Rochelle, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1987. ix + 571 pp. (Paper US \$16.95, Cloth US \$59.50). *From confrontation to negotiation: U.S. relations with Cuba.* PHILIP BRENNER. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 1988. x + 118 pp. (Cloth US \$30.00, Paper US \$9.95).

Nineteen eighty-eight marked the completion of the Cuban revolution's third decade. Several events that year suggested that Cubans might finally look forward to a lessening of the island's international isolation, if not its domestic economic woes. The revolution had survived eight years of hostility from the Reagan administration. Washington's attempts to secure international censure of Cuba on human rights grounds had culminated in the visit of a United Nations delegation, at Havana's invitation and with relatively little damage to Cuba's image. Fidel Castro's visits to Ecuador and Mexico to attend the inaugurations of two Latin American presidents underscored Cuba's reinsertion into the hemispheric community.

Finally, Cuban military successes against South African troops in Angola and Cuba's role in the subsequent negotiations over Angola and Namibia were a source of pride.

The revolution's survival was all the more extraordinary given its existence in the shadow of a superpower dedicated to its reversal. Secretary of State Alexander Haig blustered in 1981 that the U.S. would "take it to the source" - allegedly of all conflict in Central America - by confronting Havana militarily. Eight years later, Reagan officials were departing Washington while 30th anniversary parties took place in Havana.

The anniversary's proximity seems to have prompted an outpouring of new books on Cuba in 1987, 1988 and 1989. Those by Azicri, Marshall, and Stubbs, along with the team-edited *Cuba reader* - to pick only a few of those which appeared - attempt comprehensive analyses of Cuban achievements and problems at the three-decade mark. Those by Brenner, Morley and Smith focus on U.S.-Cuban relations, responding in part to the heightened tensions during the Reagan years.

With one possible exception, the books reviewed here represent original and solid contributions to our understanding of Cuba. Their authors include a former U.S. diplomat, two Britons, a Cuban-American and several North American academics. They illuminate virtually every aspect of contemporary Cuban society and explore thoroughly the last 30 years of confrontational relations between Havana and Washington.

What they do less well is anticipate emerging issues beginning to reshape Cuba's domestic reality and international relations. These have introduced new strains and uncertainties, as yet little understood, into the fabric of Cuban society. The tumultuous changes within the socialist bloc have distanced Cuba from its allies ideologically and threaten to disrupt the economic, if not necessarily the political, bonds between Moscow and Havana. This is happening as the economic downturn in Cuba leads to frustration and flagging productivity. In the realm of politics, the trial and execution of four high-ranking Cuban officials on drug trafficking and corruption charges has shaken Cuban society. Internal dissent has become slightly more organized, with small Cuban "human rights" groups gaining notice in the international, if not the domestic, arena.

Given the rapidity with which some of these events have overtaken Cuba, the authors can hardly be faulted for failing to treat them adequately. Yet one cannot help wishing for more penetrating discussion of the issues which could trigger significant changes in Cuba in the next few years.

If the goal is to document the journey Cuba has made, rather than where it may be going, none does better than *The Cuba reader*, an ambitious anthology of 56 essays. Contributors include North American, Cuban-

American and Cuban academics, journalists and officials. A few primary documents are included, such as the Platt Amendment to Cuba's 1901 constitution. A number of articles date from the 1960s and 1970s; most were written since 1980, including several prepared for this book.

The editors' premise is that American perceptions of Cuba are clouded by misinformation, and that accurate information will help improve relations between the two countries. Although the book is aimed at a general audience, specialists will welcome the impressive array of key writings on Cuba as a reference tool.

The section on foreign policy is most substantial, with contributions by former U.S. diplomat Wayne Smith, editors Brenner and LeoGrande, and Cuban vice-president Carlos Rafael Rodriguez, among others. The section on political structures also is strong, with essays by Cuban-American scholars Nelson Valdes and Jorge I. Domínguez on developments within the Cuban Communist party and government. Margaret E. Crahan and Debra Evenson contribute original essays on the Church and the legal system. By contrast, the section on the contemporary economy is thin, given the salience of economic questions in Cuba today.

The reader will want to pick and choose from this voluminous work, and to note carefully the dates of articles, as a number have been included for their historical significance and contain outdated information. But for a comprehensive picture of Cuba over the last 30 years, by leading analysts on both sides of the Florida straits, *The Cuba reader* is unequaled.

In *Cuba: The test of time*, British journalist Jean Stubbs takes a different approach. In keeping with tradition at the London-based Latin America Bureau, this slim volume offers a well-crafted synthesis of key issues. A resident of Cuba for most of the last twenty years, Stubbs manages to combine an insider's sensitivity and depth of understanding with the critical distance of the outsider. She also goes beyond the others reviewed here in anticipating emerging issues for the future.

This book's focus is on economics – Cuba's goals, the obstacles it faces, and the strategies it has pursued. Stubbs discusses the dual dollar/peso economy which has arisen partly as a result of the recent decision to encourage tourism, and shows how this feeds into a subtle malaise born of unfulfilled consumer aspirations. The revolution's very success in guaranteeing basic security to workers – while economic constraints limit the possibility of attractive material rewards – necessitates a constant search for alternative incentives to productivity and efficiency. The Cuban leadership has addressed this problem in varying ways over time, most recently through a renewed emphasis on revolutionary values.

The book gives shorter shrift to social and cultural issues. In a single

chapter, "Ethics of Liberation", the author attempts to cover political structures, human rights, male-female relations, the criminal justice system, arts and culture, and religion. The result is a glossing over of some of the most complex and challenging areas of the revolution.

The treatment of foreign policy emphasizes Cuba's development aid to the Third World and its trade with socialist and western nations. Stubbs blames the U.S. embargo for exacerbating many Cuban economic and political problems, and argues that it is becoming an even greater obstacle as Havana pursues increased economic integration with the West. Yet, she argues, it is likely that pressures from within the socialist bloc and how Cuba chooses to respond to them will be of most immediate significance.

Stubbs concludes that "Cuba 30 years on is a blend of tremendous achievements ... alongside ... growing problems of a social, economic and political kind." Internal debate over how to address these problems within socialist parameters, against the backdrop of socialist reforms elsewhere, will help shape Cuba's course in its fourth decade.

*Cuba: Politics, economics and society* is a recent addition to Pinter Publishers' series of monographs on "Marxist regimes". The hallmark of the series is detached analysis and exhaustive detail, and this book is no exception. Cuba-born Max Azicri, a professor for the last twenty years at Edinboro University in Pennsylvania, has written a thoughtful and balanced appraisal of contemporary Cuban society.

Azicri begins with a chapter on pre-1959 history which says surprisingly little about the development of Castro's revolutionary movement. Readers interested in the movement's ideological roots will find a rich source in another recent work, University of Akron professor Sheldon Liss's *Roots of Revolution: Radical thought in Cuba* (Liss 1987).

Azicri is strongest when he analyzes the changing structures and functioning of Cuba's government and Communist party. He succeeds better than most observers in balancing institutional dynamics with the factor of Castro's personal leadership. Since the creation of socialist institutions in Cuba in the 1970s, he says, the source of the government's legitimacy has somewhat shifted from Castro's charisma to an institutional base, yet Castro remains central. Although the institutional and personalistic leadership largely reinforce each other, they are also in tension, lending complexity to the Cuban political process.

The treatment of social relations is more uneven. Although Azicri examines changing male-female roles under the revolution, he does not always capture their complexity. His acknowledgement that "remnants of machismo still linger on" may strike some as a polite understatement.

Discussion of race relations, while emphasizing the basic transformation under the revolution, fails to address adequately recent policy shifts targeting the residual structural manifestations of racial stratification.

On such loaded themes as "democracy" and "dissent", Azicri identifies and contrasts the often conflicting interpretations of Cuban and outside critics. His own background may have contributed to such an approach: after working briefly for the revolutionary government, he was exposed to the anti-Castro movement in the United States in the 1960s, and later joined a group of Cuban-Americans favoring dialogue and normal relations between the two countries.

He does not appear to have an overarching thesis or theme, but simply tries to present a complete picture in scrupulously documented detail. At times the text appears in danger of collapsing under its weight of statistics, and its thoroughness produces a tendency toward repetition. Yet its density also makes this book satisfying reading and a valuable reference for anyone seriously interested in Cuba.

An American resident in Havana for many years once remarked to this reviewer: "A person can come here, spend two weeks, and go home and write a book about Cuba. Plenty of people do. But if you come and spend two months, you'll write a different book. And if you spend longer than that, you may conclude you can't write a book at all..." Peter Marshall's *Cuba Libre: Breaking the chains?* is of the two-month variety. He first visited Cuba in 1984. But he had been fascinated by the Cuban revolution since his radical student days, the British-born author says. One suspects that the extent of his initial illusions may help to explain his disillusionment now.

One is alerted to the intellectual tenor of this book early on, when Marshall inquires rhetorically whether Cuba "has ... really broken the chains of the past? Or has it forged new shackles to replace the old?" His answer is not in itself exceptional: that the revolution has largely freed Cubans from material poverty and inequality, but at a price of ideological rigidity and restrictions on individual liberties. He arrives at this via so many platitudinous observations, however, that the reader is tempted to dismiss any conclusion he attempts.

While giving Cuba credit for its many social and economic achievements, he depicts a highly militarized, repressive society. He is capable of startling reductionism ("The only difference between Cuba's economic system now and capitalism is ..."). Marshall similarly oversimplifies on the topic of religion, saying that "God is for all intents and purposes dead and buried in Cuba". He acknowledges the existence of a dialogue between the Cuban churches and the government, but argues that it is "a dialogue in which

[Castro] tends to do all the talking and which takes place on his own terms". This is untrue and sells Cuban church people short.

Marshall appears sincere in his desire to paint a balanced portrait of Cuban society on the basis of his tours of the island. But many such books already have been written, and this one covers little new ground. It well illustrates the peril of trying to judge something as complex as the Cuban revolution from an outsider's vantage point.

Authors Smith, Morley and Brenner do not attempt to render such judgement. Their concern is the relationship between the United States and Cuba, particularly the way in which Washington's Cuba policy has been made and implemented. All three conclude that U.S. policymaking toward Havana over the past 30 years has been a striking failure, and that U.S. interests would be better served by adopting a less confrontational approach.

Wayne Smith was a junior officer in the U.S. embassy in Havana when Castro's triumphant forces marched into the city. Recalled to Washington when the U.S. broke relations with Cuba in 1961, he spent the next eighteen years in other diplomatic posts and at the State Department's Cuba desk. In 1979, under the Carter administration, Smith returned to Havana to become the chief of the newly-formed U.S. Interests Section.

Smith watched with growing dismay as the Carter/Vance opening to Cuba gave way first to the Cold War views of Carter's national security advisor, Zbigniew Brzezinski, and then to the aggressively confrontational posture of the Reagan administration. After his repeated attempts to urge more constructive policies met with disinterest or hostility at higher levels, he resigned from the foreign service in 1982. *The closest of enemies* is Smith's absorbing account of his experiences during these years.

Its major theme is missed opportunities. Time and again, U.S. officials ignored or rebuffed overtures from the Cuban government which could have led to better relations. Initially, Smith notes, Washington did make overtures to Castro which the Cuban leader rejected. By 1963, however, Castro was signalling his interest in an accommodation and offering a number of concessions. The U.S. State Department responded by demanding the impossible: that Cuba break all its ties with the Soviet Union *before* any talks could begin, effectively giving up its security shield without guarantees that U.S. hostility would cease.

In 1978, after the Carter administration froze the process of normalization begun several years earlier, the Cubans again reached out. Castro offered to sit down at the negotiating table, and the Cubans went on to release a large number of political prisoners as a unilateral concession. The U.S. responded by sending warships to within a few miles of the Cuban coast

for intimidating naval maneuvers. Yet again in 1981, when Cuba suspended its arms shipments to Nicaragua, the Reagan administration dismissed the gesture and refused Havana's offer to discuss Central America - all the while insisting that Cuban interference was at the root of conflicts in the region.

In these cases and others, U.S. officials passed up opportunities to talk because fundamentally they were not interested in reaching an accommodation. Rather, they saw Cuban concessions as signs of weakness, and hoped that further hardening of the U.S. position would lead to Cuban capitulation. Smith's position was that real disagreements indeed separated Washington and Havana, but that U.S. interests could best be advanced through step-by-step negotiation of the matters at issue.

Smith blames the demise of the Carter opening squarely on Brzezinski's National Security Council, which used Cuban involvement in Africa as an excuse to halt normalization. Smith's detailed discussion of Cuba's African role is particularly useful. In contrast to the prevailing U.S. mythology blaming the Soviet Union and Cuba for unprovoked aggression in Angola, Smith adds his voice to those who blame the U.S. for first escalating and internationalizing the Angolan civil war. Although he believed the official version at first, his outrage grew as, in 1977, U.S. officials claimed a Cuban troop buildup in Angola (there was none) and blamed Cuba for instigating the revolt in Zaire's Shaba province (it hadn't).

A fascinating sub-plot in *The closest of enemies* is Smith's personal journey of conscience. One can empathize with his discomfiture when, in meetings with his Cuban counterparts, he had to defend official U.S. statements he knew to be untrue. "As a Foreign Service officer serving at the pleasure of the president, I could not openly take issue with the views of my superiors", he writes. "Neither was I going to lie for them..."

Smith does not challenge the underlying assumption that U.S. security interests required limiting Soviet and Cuban influence in the hemisphere. But he sees that goal as more effectively accomplished by pragmatic and honest diplomacy than by force, intimidation and deception. The failure of such common-sense views to penetrate the U.S. foreign policy community is a good indicator of the hysteria which still dominates U.S. attitudes toward Cuba.

Morris Morley's *Imperial state and revolution* examines U.S. policy toward Cuba over a similar period, from 1952 (the date of Batista's coup) to 1986. In contrast to Smith, who often highlights differences between agencies and individuals involved in making policy, Morley emphasizes a continuity of assumptions and purpose which have undergirded policymaking. He argues that the "imperial state", reflecting the interests of the U.S. capitalist



class, has sought to "open, and keep open, as much of the world economy as possible in the interests of foreign capital accumulation and expansion". Accordingly, successive U.S. administrations have used varying tactics in a continuing campaign to prevent, and later reverse, the establishment of an anti-capitalist government in Cuba.

Morley's particular concern is the interaction between the international system and the imperial state as it pursues these goals. Castro's success in moving Cuba rapidly out of the U.S. political and economic orbit meant that bilateral U.S. pressures had diminishing effectiveness. This led Washington to regionalize and then internationalize the confrontation, pressuring other countries to isolate Cuba diplomatically and economically.

During the 1960s, while carrying out a "secret war" of sabotage against Cuba from U.S. soil, the Kennedy and Johnson administrations applied pressure to each Latin American nation to secure its cooperation in isolating Cuba. European countries also were urged to cut trade and transport links with Havana, and most did. During the 1970s, however, this multilateral economic blockade began to crumble. Capitalist countries from Japan to Spain, responding to their own economic interests, steadily increased trade and credit links with Havana. Eventually, Washington's Cuba embargo became more effective in isolating the U.S. from its own allies than in isolating Cuba.

Morley pays little attention to what was happening on the Cuban side, either in terms of its response to U.S. actions or its diplomacy toward other states. Rather, this is essentially a study of the U.S. foreign policy process and of the limits on economic sanctions as a form of intervention in an interdependent world. But Morley shows how the U.S. preoccupation with Cuba spilled over into U.S. relations with virtually every nation in Latin America and even Europe. It is exhaustively documented with both interviews and primary sources, a careful and well-argued study.

Philip Brenner's *From confrontation to negotiation* departs from a similar perspective, but has more narrowly defined aims. Brenner, who teaches international relations at American University, wrote the book for the Washington-based organization Policy Alternatives for the Caribbean and Central America (PACCA). Arguing that U.S. policy toward Cuba has failed to achieve its objectives, he outlines a concise blueprint for change.

Brenner offers a useful discussion of key issues dividing the two countries, both bilateral (such as Radio Martí and the Guantánamo base) and multilateral (primarily Cuban involvement in Central America and Angola). He argues that none of Cuba's demands threatens fundamental U.S. security, while Washington's demand that Cuba unilaterally renounce its Soviet alliance places Cuba at risk. Without any change in this U.S. posture, he concludes, significant reduction in tensions remains unlikely.

Brenner correctly asserts that U.S. hostility has become counter-productive in regards to the goal of having Cuba reduce its Soviet ties. At the same time, he assigns perhaps too much importance to the U.S. threat in shaping every aspect of Cuban behavior. His focus on the Soviet-Cuban alliance, without mention of its incipient contradictions, may render the book an inadequate guide to the complexities of the coming period.

Brenner emphasizes the need not just for new policies, but for new U.S. attitudes recognizing Cuba's sovereignty and right to self-determination. Sadly, this shift in basic assumptions is likely to be far harder to achieve than the pragmatic negotiations on specific issues that he proposes.

In a period in which the Soviet Union appears increasingly open to diversity within its sphere of influence, one might hope that the United States would move in a similar direction. But the evidence from these books and from recent political events makes it more likely that the U.S. will seize on any emergent Cuban weakness to carry its vendetta into a fourth decade.

#### REFERENCES

LISS, SHELDON B., 1987. *Roots of Revolution: Radical thought in Cuba*. Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press.

CATHERINE A. SUNSHINE  
Ecumenical Program on Central America & the Caribbean (EPICA)  
Washington, DC 20010, U.S.A.

## BOOK REVIEWS

*Dimensions of a Creole continuum: history, texts, and linguistic analysis of Guyanese Creole.* JOHN R. RICKFORD. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1987. xix + 340 pp. (Cloth US \$42.50)

*Pidgin and Creole languages.* SUZANNE ROMAINE. London and New York: Longman, 1988. xi + 373 pp. (Paper US \$16.95)

In the past two decades, the blossoming field of pidgin and creole studies has attracted considerably greater attention than before in linguistics and related disciplines. The two books by Suzanne Romaine and John Rickford are, in different ways, important additions to the growing literature on the subject.

Rickford focuses on the concept of creole continuum in relation to the data on Guyanese creole. To Rickford, this notion assumes that the various dialects in a creole speech community constitute a continuous and *unidimensional* variation from the basilect (creole) to the acrolect ("standard"), each dialect differing from the one next to it with respect to a linguistic feature or rule in the panlectal grid. Rickford suggests that this notion does not involve *a priori* assumptions regarding the importance of the social and stylistic dimensions of linguistic variation, the stage of development of mesolectal varieties in the continuum (at the beginning, or after the development of the basilect), the direction of change (whether the change is unilinear in the direction of the acrolect).

In the first chapter, Rickford defends the analytical value of the creole continuum concept for the analysis of linguistic reality in Guyana and Jamaica, but not in Haiti or Martinique. To Rickford, the concept does not imply that all the dialects in the continuum exist with equal frequency, either in usage or in the number of speakers. Rickford argues in favor

of unidimensional analyses, whenever possible, due to their simplicity, while granting the high probability of multidimensional variations (e.g., regional or sociopolitically embedded variations not along the basilect-acrolect continuum, such as with the lects of Rastafarians in Jamaica). It is unclear to this reader how efforts to reduce the multi-dimensionality of such linguistic variations to a unidimensional analysis do not involve an *a priori* assumption on the lesser significance of pragmatic variables. Chapter two examines the historical and sociolinguistic backgrounds of Guyanese creole since the seventeenth century. Rickford suggests no significant change in the basilect in the past century, despite the probable decline in the number of its speakers and in the frequency of its usage. This lack of fundamental change, to Rickford, results from the working class's limited opportunities for upward mobility and from the structuration of the Guyanese basilect as a symbol of sociopolitical solidarity (p. 74).

The second part of Rickford's book (chapters 3-6) comprises his detailed analyses of the reproduced texts (accompanied by English glosses) – texts from both earlier historical periods and the contemporary era. The former category is composed mostly of British representations of late-eighteenth and nineteenth-century Guyanese creole. The latter includes excerpts of tape-recorded narratives from the Indo-Guyanese community of Cane Walk (a sample of eight speakers of different age groups, both gender, and different class backgrounds); texts of narratives from other communities, as well as the reproduction of written and oral texts across a wide variety of speech interactional contexts (from folklore, radio, newspapers, a classroom, and a court session). Rickford's analyses of the reproduced texts contain numerous insightful comments, although it would be useful to systematically present in a panlectal grid all the ideolect-differentiating features in the Cane Walk speech community.

Partly a textbook and partly a critical review of the existing literature, Romaine's *Pidgin and Creole Languages* provides a broader overview of pidgin and creole studies than Rickford's work. After an historical introduction to pidgin and creole studies and a brief examination of the present distribution of pidgins and creoles (chapter 1), Romaine discusses the definitions and characteristics of pidgins and creoles (ch. 2), the theories on the origin of pidgins (ch. 3), the life-cycles of pidgins and creoles (chapters 4 and 5), the role of language universals in pidgin and creole development in comparison to first and second language acquisition, as well as the sources of these universals (chapters 6 and 7).

Romaine's analysis of the life-cycles of pidgins and creoles is strongly influenced by the work of Peter Muhlhausler who suggests two basic dimensions of change. The first dimension, called a developmental con-

tinuum, involves an increase in the overall referential and non-referential power of a language: from jargons (New Guinea Bush "pidgins"), to stable pidgins (Russenorsk), to expanded pidgins (Tok Pisin), to creoles (Hawaiian Creole, Haitian Creole). A creole can develop from any point in this developmental continuum (jargons, stable pidgins, and expanded pidgins), with the greatest pidgin-creole continuity in the creolization of an expanded pidgin (pp. 48, 205). The second dimension, called a restructuring continuum, involves change due to language contact without an overall increase in referential and non-referential power (p. 155). This is the case, for example, with the creole continuum in Guyana discussed in depth in Rickford's work. De-creolization and re-creolization (change respectively towards and away from the acrolect) exemplify this restructuring process.

Comparing pidgins and creoles respectively to second and first language acquisition and in relation to empirical data on relative clauses, Romaine suggests certain parallels between child language on the one hand, and pidgins and creoles on the other (chapter 6). Focusing on the role of language universals in the process of ontogenetic and phylogenetic language development and with a particular focus on Bickerton's language bioprogram thesis, Romaine points out that a certain degree of cross-linguistic variation in the ontogenetic developmental process exists as a function of acquisition contexts (pp. 289-292). Romaine also suggests the need to pay a greater attention to the social context of creolization (pp. 311-312). On the similarities between child language and creoles, especially in the tense-modality-aspect system, Romaine emphasizes the possibility that many similarities may result from certain cognitive operating principles rather than from a common language bioprogram. She suggests:

No doubt change is constrained by biological limits which specify what a human language can be like. There is more work to be done before claims can be substantiated as to which universals of languages are innate and which are by-products of the way in which humans are structured and function (p. 309).

Drawing partly on her earlier work on language change and acquisition, Romaine has provided an important critical survey of the field of pidgin and creole studies. It is particularly useful to non-creolists such as this reviewer. With numerous definitions of linguistic terms throughout the text, the book can also serve as a text in an advanced course on the subject, although a comprehensive glossary at the end would make it more accessible to area specialists without much knowledge of linguistics, and although most non-linguists might find unusually dense the literature review in chapter two. Also, the text could have been proofread more carefully (e.g.,

there are errors in figure 4.1 [p. 117] and punctuations are needed in figure 5.9 [p. 198]).

Substantively, despite the important contributions of the book, Romaine's points are at times rather confusing, partly because of a less than consistent use of certain key terms. For example, on the one hand, Romaine proposes that in contrast to first language acquisition, "[o]nly when a pidgin expands does it develop a pragmatic component and expressive functions" (p. 151). On the other, Romaine suggests that "a main source of developments in creolization is the grammaticalization of distinction and the movement from a more pragmatic to a more syntactic mode of communication" (p. 302). If creolization can start from jargons and stable pidgins, supposedly with little of a pragmatic component, how can creolization also involve a shift from a pragmatic mode of communication, unless the term "pragmatic" has two different meanings in Romaine's analysis?

Similarly, Romaine proposes: "The continuing process of realignment of linguistic norms is an on-going source of change in individual and community ways of speaking. When codes and variables lose their symbolic function as markers of various social identities, the way for linguistic change is paved" (p. 203). Yet, de-creolization and re-creolization take place as a part of the process of language change because in the negotiation of identities in speech interaction, speakers may choose either the acrolect as a symbol of power, or the basilect as a symbol of sociopolitical solidarity. Romaine herself recognizes the significance of these choices in her discussion of the re-creolization process among British Black children (pp. 188-203). The role of these choices in the linguistic structuration process would have been illuminated with a systematic discussion of the political economy of the world system within which they are embedded.

Romaine's *Pidgin and Creole studies* provides a broad survey of the issues and the literature for linguists and other students with a firm introductory-level background in linguistics who are interested in this area of inquiry. In contrast, less ambitious in scope, Rickford's book offers a wealth of insightfully commented data on Guyanese creole which would be of interest not only to creolists, but also to folklorists and anthropologists working on the Caribbean.

HY VAN LUONG  
Department of Anthropology  
The Johns Hopkins University  
Baltimore, Maryland 21218, U.S.A.

*Afro-Caribbean villages in historical perspective.* CHARLES V. CARNEGIE (ed.). Jamaica: African-Caribbean Institute of Jamaica, 1987. x + 133 pp. (Paper Jamaica \$50.00)

This special issue of the Afro-Caribbean Institute of Jamaica Review is "a collection of case studies" focused on the formation of independent – mostly present – communities in the region. In his introduction the editor notes that while the village community is the social unit with which each writer is concerned, the "intention is not to present unit studies that claim ... to be representative of the whole society..." but "to raise questions about the development of community life in a range of societies which share, to varying degrees, historical and cultural patterns" (p. iv). A second objective would be to forge fresh "organizational categories" that would facilitate a more cogent analysis and understanding of Caribbean societies. All of the communities under consideration emerged in the immediate post-Emancipation period. The condition, historical and cultural, they have in common is the rise and fall of the West Indian plantation system.

Of the six essays, Sidney Mintz's "Historical Sociology of Jamaican Villages" is the earliest. Two additional essays, "Is Family Land an Institution" by Charles V. Carnegie, and "Family Land as a Model for Martha Brae's New History: Culture Building in an Afro-Caribbean Village" by Jean Besson are also about Jamaica. Two of the remaining three essays are about mainland communities: Trevor W. Purcell's "Modern Maroons: Economy and Cultural Survival in a 'Jamaican' Peasant Village in Costa Rica" and O. Nigel Bolland's "African Continuities and Creole Culture in Belize Town in the Nineteenth Century". Karen Fog Olwig's "Village, Culture and Identity on St. John, V.I." treats the development of an independent village community in the Virgin Islands.

Mintz has been among the deans of Caribbean studies for some time, and his influence can be clearly seen in the various essays. The methodological approach of historical reconstruction carries forward a practice for which he is well noted, and two dicta central to his thought and work – (i) the West Indian plantation as a social structure and set of cultural ideas is omni-present in all Caribbean history; and (ii) African-American culture must be understood principally as a product of slavery and the plantation experience, not as any direct survival of an African provenience – constitute a point of departure for each of the writers' in this volume.

A most important dynamic from this point of view is that of 'resistance', a feature which it is assumed pervaded the thought and activities of slaves and freedmen in their relationship to the plantation. Consequently, the best way to understand the emergence of independent Afro-Caribbean

communities would be to see them as centers of resistance to plantation dominance, that, over the years, achieved a certain longevity, and institutional integrity. Much is therefore made of the acquisition of land – the basis of independence and community – and the maintenance of tenure from one generation to another. In all of the cases, except Belize, we see independent communities getting their start on marginal or abandoned land.

Variations in the methods of land acquisition – from the organizing of capital by the Baptist church in Jamaica to the acceptance of land in exchange for labor in Costa Rica – indicate that plantation structures may have been less formidable in some instances, leaving room for the development of cognitive orientations alternative to those predicated upon plantation slavery. Olwig and Purcell demonstrate that “resistance” is also very much a creative turn of mind. “Community”, as an aspect of group psychology linked with certain cultural choices and social activities, could have its inception long before the actual acquisition of land, and survive its loss as well.

Bolland and Carnegie in their essays find it plausible that African continuities are important elements in the independent Afro-Caribbean cultural world. For the development of Belize Town, where the remote log camp and not the immediate plantation drove the economic system, Bolland’s historical data show Africans, Europeans, West Indians, Garifuna and others, all drawn together in a small proto-urban setting. He posits that in this crucible, as the result of a dynamic system of sharing and borrowing, modern Belizean creole culture was developed, with Africans making a distinctive contribution to the complex. He seems to base his argument on the primacy of contextual constraints and processes of acculturation. One wishes that both context and processes received fuller ethnographic treatment in his work.

Carnegie does draw on the rich ethnographic data on “family land” to argue against the practice of presenting Afro-Caribbean land tenure as a set of discrete institutional arrangements, preferring what he calls an intersystemic approach. He re-states the case for a concern with flexibility and transformation as basic principles in Afro-Caribbean land tenure – and by extension, culture. He also argues that given a similar penchant “for ambiguity, for imprecision, for flexibility” in “African systems of thought” (p. 96) continuity may well be as fundamental a motive as resistance in the formation of Afro-Caribbean culture. Besson, too, writes in favor of an intersystemic approach, although she spends a good part of her essay in a defensive riposte against Carnegie’s critique of her earlier work on land tenure.



There is some disagreement between these two on the orientation and significance of certain analytical concepts, and the emphasis which should be given to various lines of explanation. The "controversy" comes across more as a jousting over intellectual rights, than as a substantive disagreement on the values and processes central to the inception and survival of an Afro-Caribbean culture. To the extent that the debate promotes a careful seriousness as these scholars seek an integrated paradigm for the understanding of Caribbean societies it is a welcome feature.

This is a small volume, and clearly incomplete in its presentation of Afro-Caribbean village types. But in the scope of its intention, the energy of the later research, and the younger writers' willingness to forge fresh concepts that take into account the ideas, orientation, and will of Caribbean peoples themselves, it is quite stimulating. The utility of "the community study" is well demonstrated here. Hopefully, additional cases will follow.

JOHN STEWART  
Department of English  
The Ohio State University  
Columbus, Ohio 43210, U.S.A.

*Land and development in the Caribbean.* JEAN BESSON and JANET MOMSEN (eds.). London: Macmillan Caribbean, 1987. xi + 228 pp. (Paper UK £9.95)

*Small farming and peasant resources in the Caribbean.* JOHN BRIERLEY and HYMIE RUBENSTEIN (eds.). Winnipeg, Canada: University of Manitoba, 1988. xvii + 133 pp. (Paper, Canadian \$15.00)

Both volumes comprise collections of papers which are concerned with peasant and small farmer practice and culture, especially in the English speaking Caribbean. The collections are even more closely related than the titles would indicate. The authors, with one exception (a historian), are all anthropologists or geographers, based in North America or the United Kingdom, and (in one case) Denmark. Eight of the seventeen papers have been contributed by four authors.

The main themes studied in the individual cases are how the "small people" in the Caribbean use their land and labour in sustaining themselves. The relationship of people to land – their attitudes, rights, and the significance of land, symbolically as well as economically, is the subject

of many of the papers. Others concentrate on establishing the resourcefulness of peasant farmers, and their ability to respond to widely different conditions.

The publication of these two volumes is to be welcomed because they serve as "open days" to the enclaves where groups of scholars work. It will be convenient first to pass from stall to stall noting the individual goods, before viewing the collections from a distance.

The first seven chapters in *Land and Development in the Caribbean* are preoccupied with land, each treating different aspects by reference to one (or more) island case(s). Jean Besson is concerned with the significance of family land holding on land use and production. She examines the paradoxical perceptions by peasants of land as both a scarce and an unlimited resource, first looking at a Jamaican case, before reviewing the regional situation from the literature. Janet Momsen reviews the historic process of land settlement in the (former) "West Indies", and examines its effects on land use in Nevis. The adaptation of the state land-settlement arrangements to customary needs is explored.

The means of acquisition of land, transference of property, and attitudes determining use, are studied by Hymie Rubenstein in St. Vincent. The attention to these ideological factors complements an earlier consideration of the effects of demography, ecology, and economy on land use in the same case. The Bahamas is the setting for a survey of the evolution of land tenure, by Michael Craton, which traces the pattern of conflict between customary values and the official legal system into the period of Independence.

Barbuda is a case with similarities to the Bahamas. Riva Berleant-Schiller demonstrates the resistance of the Barbudan folk system to the invasion of extraneous development initiatives. (Since the paper was written more exotic, even bizarre, invasions have been opposed.) By contrast tourism has had a significant effect on customary attitudes to land in Negril, Jamaica. Lesley McKay demonstrates how the growth of tourism has brought about an inflation in land values which has prejudiced the pattern of customary tenure. Karen Fog Olwig's study of children's attitudes in Nevis demonstrates the conflict between the practical effects and tradition of migration, and the sense of a secure national community.

The three final papers in the volume are more directly concerned with agricultural development. Rice production in Guyana is the subject of Eric Hanley's paper. John Brierley looks at the effect of land fragmentation on the use of land in Grenada. Frank Innes considers the scope for increasing food production from peasant farming in the Commonwealth Caribbean.

The volume *Small Farming and Peasant Resources in the Caribbean* is

a more varied collection. Only one of the papers is preoccupied with land tenure. In it, Besson concentrates on the same Jamaican case she referred to more briefly in the previous volume. She examines the historic development of customary land tenure as a response to increasing land scarcity, and the interrelationship of the customary and the official legal systems.

Theo Hills addresses the question as to whether Caribbean Peasant Food Forests represent "Ecological Artistry" or "Random Chaos". He assesses the physical aspects of the Food Forest systems against the socio-economic context and takes the view that "Ecological Artistry" is closer to the truth. Peasant cocoa cultivators are shown by Kathleen Phillips-Lewis to have been responsible not only for making a major contribution to the 'Golden Age' of cocoa production in Trinidad (1866-1920) but also from the crop's early beginnings in the colony.

In his study of small farming in Grenada, John Brierley draws attention to the resilience of peasant farming and recognises that it implies resistance to change besides being a source of stability. Janet Momsen deals with the neglected role of women in Caribbean agriculture, referring in turn to their importance in the plantation system prior to emancipation and to their contribution during recent decades in the Eastern Caribbean.

Another neglected area is the subject of a paper by Hymie Rubenstein. He reports on the impact of marijuana cultivation on land use, incomes, and social organization in St. Vincent. The study confirms that cultivation involving high risks is not unattractive to young men if the prospective returns are high enough. The remaining paper in the volume, by David Griffiths, explores the effects of seasonal migration to the United States on peasant production in Jamaica, and suggests that such migration may contribute to peasant farm and household development.

The publication of these volumes represents an appropriate occasion to remark on the growth of understanding gained through research on the twin subjects of peasant farming, and land tenure in the Commonwealth Caribbean. Less than half a century ago, customary tenure was virtually unrecognised and peasant farming looked down on by the better educated and more prosperous members of the colonial societies. In the late 1950's, in Jamaica – which had recently celebrated three hundred years of British rule – the Registrar of Titles replied, in response to a question about multiple ownership of "Family Land": "We always find *the owner*". Peasant cultivation was regarded by the professional staff of Departments of Agriculture as backward and inefficient, while the cultivators were considered ignorant.

The papers relating to land tenure reveal how far the discussion has gone beyond the earlier received wisdom. The recognition of the existence

of the folk forms and the description of their features have been followed by a growing understanding of their significance and an examination of their viability under pressure from both tourism and migration.

The earlier denigration of peasant cultivation was supported and justified by criticism from a narrow technical base. Traditional methods of cultivation were assumed to be inferior to the modern, "scientific" methods. Mixed cropping was regarded as inferior to mono-cropping because the yield per acre of an individual crop was lower in the case of mixed cropping.

The work of social scientists, including agricultural economists and geographers (with Donald Innis proving to be an admirable pioneer), led to a recognition of the effectiveness of the peasant farming system in meeting family, communal, and even national needs. The implicit rationale of the system came to be discerned. The stage has now been reached where the vulnerability and limitations of peasant farming are being charted by researchers sympathetic to discovering the strengths and virtues of the peasant systems.

For someone outside the circle of Caribbeanists it is interesting to note the absence from the collections of contributions from (for example) "economists", and the virtual absence of Caribbean-based contributors, whether from the Commonwealth or non-Commonwealth Caribbean. When the early studies on the Caribbean were being undertaken by "social scientists", there was an expectation that multidisciplinary, pan-Caribbean, and interregional cooperation in research would grow. If the collections reflect the real extent of such cooperation, these expectations have not been realized. It would be interesting, if not very useful, to speculate on the causes and consequences of the pattern of research which has evolved.

DAVID T. EDWARDS  
Development and Project Planning Centre  
University of Bradford  
Bradford, West Yorkshire, BD7 1DP, U.K.

*Politics in Jamaica.* ANTHONY J. PAYNE. London and New York: C. Hurst and Company, St. Martin's Press, 1988. xii + 196 pp. (Cloth US \$ 29.95)

During the 1980s there has been a plethora of literature concerning Jamaican politics. Much of this literature has addressed in particular the adversities of Michael Manley's democratic socialist regime of the 1970s (see for

instance, Beckford and Witter 1980; Kaufmann 1985; Manley 1982, 1987; Stone 1985, 1989; Waters 1985). There has been a variety of issues to discuss: Manley's own experiment with a "third path" to development; Jamaica's relationship with Cuba during the 1970s and 1980s; the fate of Jamaica's democratic institutions; the role of IMF negotiations in structuring domestic politics; the implications of the United States' incursion in Grenada; the issue of style in Jamaica's so-called "reggae" politics, and more importantly, the role of black nationalism in the Caribbean. All of these issues, to a greater or lesser extent, bring into focus the power of the United States to dominate the Caribbean region due to vulnerable economies and weak state structures among the Caribbean nations. The limited scope for political manoeuvre in styling domestic policy and regional alliances has been underlined during the last twenty years.

Payne's study does not add a great deal that is new to these debates or to the information on which they are based. It does present an assessment of Manley's Peoples' National Party (PNP) governments of the 1970s alongside Edward Seaga's Jamaica Labour Party (JLP) governments of the 1980s. This assessment is concerned primarily with economic policy, and Payne's account makes rather dismal reading. Neither government was able to provide a viable long term strategy to manage with any great finesse a vulnerable economy based on limited commodity exports and minimal manufacturing. Seaga's strategy reflected standard IMF policies; reduce the cost of labor, limit the value of imports in relation to exports and wait for the capital investment to come. In an economy with the very limited advantages that Jamaica commands, the strategy can have only the hypothetical success that things might have been worse if another strategy had been followed. Manley's strategies involved not only a very tempered move toward nationalization, but also toward expanding and varying the range of trading relationships open to Jamaica. Since the 1970s nationalization has been shown throughout the Third World to be a problematic policy when pursued in isolation from other economic adjustments. Manley's more important initiative, in broadening the scope of Jamaican foreign relations, was made problematic by the North American hegemony in the region. This hegemony became even more apparent during the Grenada crisis and Payne's account of the effect of this crisis on CARICOM relations again makes interesting and sobering reading. These types of issue, however, have been canvassed before and so one is moved to question not the adequacy but the importance of Payne's book. How can it be read most profitably?

The book is interesting for what is said and what remains unsaid. Although Payne's treatment of Manley and Seaga is remarkably even-

handed in comparison with other literature, his discussion of Manley and the PNP governments is rather more lively and engaged than his account of the Seaga-JLP administrations. Payne seems to lean slightly toward socialist policies for Jamaica. He at least suggests there is some prospect in this area for further developments (p. 182), whereas Seaga's JLP policies appear to have reached a dead-end. (This latter situation has been recognised more generally even by that conservative journal of record, *The Economist*, which participates from time to time in the North-South debate.) These are the things which are "said" in Payne's book.

What is left unsaid is the extraordinary difficulty of economic and social policy-making in a society of Jamaica's size and regional location. The problem with situating a discussion of contemporary Jamaican politics between the poles of socialist and free enterprise strategy is that neither policy, as they have been formulated in a European context, may be particularly useful in a society like Jamaica. Not only does Jamaica not have the range of trading options available to most European states, it also has social-historical and ultimately political concerns that are quite absent in the European milieu.

An inability to handle this fact is reflected most clearly in Payne's treatment of Michael Manley's time in government. Payne characterises Manley as a pragmatist (p. 49) and a populist (p. 81). Predictably he has difficulty in accounting for Manley's foreign policy commitments with regard to Cuba and Angola when, according to Manley's (1982:113-117) own account, they affected so detrimentally the negotiation of loan funds at a very crucial time. In Payne's view, this commitment should have been tempered in order to let the funds flow. The consequent lack of judgement at a crucial point, a "muddle" in Payne's words, irremediably weakened the Manley regime. If economic thinking, however, is part of a larger political economy concerning the historical role of societies, perhaps the choice for Manley was not so easy. Self-contained domestic redistribution of wealth would accomplish relatively little in Jamaica if the society remained overwhelmingly subject to United States' censure. Major domestic reform in Jamaica has always rested on a resituating of that society in terms of foreign and trade relations so that United States control might be significantly loosened. Cuba's progress since 1958 shows how difficult that task is and how readily such strategies simply resituate a small nation at some other point in the power plays of metropolitan nations. If Manley had capitulated he would have committed himself to a position little different from Seaga's governments. In not capitulating he held onto the notion of an alternative Third World strategy, but at great cost both to the people and his government. Socialist theory of the European variety

is notably weak on issues of trade because it was formulated for policies enacted within the boundaries of nation states. Caribbean politics, among other regional politics, is rather more complex.

Payne's insensitivity to these regional characteristics is signalled in the very early pages of his book. There he attributes the continuing democratic tendencies of the Jamaican polity entirely to the influence of British education on Jamaica's elite (pp. 4-5). Conjoined with his references to a "frenetic" electorate which contributes to "hysterical" mass meetings (p. 47) Payne seems to miss the point about Jamaican politics. Situated close to the United States, with a mobile and resourceful workforce, Jamaica is a small society with increasingly sophisticated levels of public opinion seeking to charter its own political course. The people themselves are not beholden to specific ideologies that have their origins in Europe, but they do see local advantage in a multiple party system (see Austin 1984: ch.5). Combined with an economy that does produce sufficient resources to support such a system, this climate allows Jamaica's political elite the latitude to experiment, from time to time, with different regional initiatives. In Manley's case these initiatives have also had national historical significance for Jamaican people in identifying them with Third World peoples rather than with the racial hierarchy that is North America. These conditions and initiatives will continue, influenced by – but ultimately independent of – the climate of European opinion.

Payne's analysis, like others of its genre, treats Jamaica as a laboratory of the struggle between socialist and non-socialist doctrine and appraises the players accordingly. The players prove disappointing and are reprimanded. Possibly Jamaica's politics should be read in a different way more concerned with the constitution of a nation which understands its interest and value in a particular historical environment. The residual categories "pragmatic" and "populist" are simply not good enough to subsume Jamaica's complex political modes.

#### REFERENCES

AUSTIN, DIANE J., 1984. *Urban life in Kingston Jamaica: the culture and class ideology of two neighbourhoods*. Caribbean Studies Series No. 3. London, New York, Tokyo: Gordon and Breach Science Publishers.

BECKFORD, GEORGE and M. WITTER, 1980. *Small garden, bitter weed*. Morant Bay: Maroon Publishing House.

KAUFMAN, MICHAEL, 1985. *Jamaica under Manley: dilemmas of socialism and democracy*. London, Ontario, Connecticut: Zed Books, Between the Lines, Lawrence Hilland Co.

MANLEY, MICHAEL, 1982. *Jamaica: struggle in the periphery*. London: Third World Media Ltd.

———, 1987. *Up the down escalator: Development and international economy – a Jamaican case study*. London: Andre Deutsch.

STONE, CARL, 1985. *Class, state and democracy in Jamaica*. Kingston: Blackett Publishing.

———, 1989. *Politics versus economics: the 1989 elections in Jamaica*. Kingston: Heinemann.

WATERS, A., 1985. *Race, class and political symbols: rastafari and reggae in Jamaican politics*. New Brunswick, NJ.: Transaction Books.

DIANE J. AUSTIN-BROOS  
Department of Anthropology  
University of Sydney  
Australia

*Race, class, and political symbols: rastafari and reggae in Jamaican politics*. ANITA M. WATERS. New Brunswick, New Jersey: Transaction Books, 1985. ix + 343 pp. (Cloth US \$34.95)

A 1970 performance of *Waiting for Godot* at the University of the West Indies, Mona, featured a Dreadlocks in the role of Lucky. The symbolism was not lost on several Trenchtown Elders who attended the play, for they still make reference to blind Pozzo leading Lucky by a shorter and shorter rope, likening this to the way in which JLP and PNP officials bend "poor Lucky Rasta" to their own uses. From the Elders' perspective the play heralded a period during which both parties hopped aboard the Rastafari bandwaggon in an attempt to manipulate the Jamaican voting public. In her book, *Race, class, and political symbols*, Anita Waters provides a detailed history of this cooptation exercise.

Waters' central question is why "a political party would identify itself with a millenarian cult whose beliefs are sharply at odds with a majority of the electorate, whose membership never exceeds about 3% of the population, and whose members exhort each other not to participate in politics at all" (pp. 3 and 305). Her concern, stated dramatically as an extreme cultural paradox, certainly catches our attention; but then it tends



to dissolve on closer examination as a false problematique. For Rastafari, as much as it can be treated as a peripheral cult, can just as well be regarded as a religious movement with visionary overtones that articulates closely with traditional Jamaican religious culture. Although certain tenets of Rastafari knowledge, such as the Divinity of Haile Selassie I, are not shared by the wider public, its African orientation, anti-colonialism, class consciousness, and Biblical fundamentalism resonate with Jamaican culture in general. Why, then, should the established parties *not* turn to it for guidance in the matter of their popular appeal? In the end Waters herself recognizes that Rastafari expresses social protest and cultural resistance at the popular level, so she should be drawn to conclude that not to appropriate Rastafari culture for partisan purposes would be an opportunity missed.

Using public documents for the most part, Waters very thoroughly reconstructs events surrounding the five general elections from 1967 to 1983. There is a variety of material presented here, some of which could only be obtained through dogged determination. For this reason alone, the book will surely serve as a reference work for Caribbean scholars. Unfortunately, the bulk of information is organized in a plodding fashion. Repetively, the account of each election proceeds according to the categories of party strategy, class, race, Rastafari, and reggae. Although one suspects Waters is by and large sympathetic to the moral righteousness of Rastafari, she carries out her analysis in a rather distanced manner. The book in fact is an excellent and detailed history of Jamaican electoral culture in the post-Independence period.

*Race, class and political symbols* spares the reader yet another lengthy review of Rastafari history and culture, using the same familiar sources, but it is nevertheless misleading for Waters to claim that "a number of fine ethnographies about Rastafari have been published over the years" (p. 30). Actually, very little detailed ethnographic work has been published on Rastafari, even though a number of anthropologists have spent time studying it. Brushing over this unhappy fact simply will not do because it leaves us with the impression – false – that the social world of Rastafari is known, and that it needn't be further considered. In fact, ethnographic research reveals how Rastafari is part of the Jamaican cultural fabric, and not merely a phenomenon apart.

We also need to know more about the way in which Rastafari functions as a form of social protest and popular resistance. Waters implies that somehow Rastafari and reggae are invariably linked, yet what about those most fundamentalist Rastafari, orthodox Nyahbinghi brethren who guard Rastafari cultural tradition and eschew reggae as the work of Babylon?

At the level of grass roots or yard politics, still other brethren reason about the mystifications of the dominant culture and coin appropriate symbolisms to challenge its hegemony. As often as not sympathetic outsiders, including artists and musicians, may be present to participate in this flow of wisdom. Sooner or later some of these experiential truths are encoded in popular formats, with increasingly universal appeal. How are we to understand this processing of symbolism, from parochial face-to-face encounters to global relevance through electronic media? Waters has tapped into a dynamic here that does not end at the level of Jamaican national politics.

Ultimately the book diverges from its initial concern with Rastafari and reggae, as Waters occupies herself with the grander theme of Jamaica's electoral process in the post-Independence period. For Waters, the larger issue concerns the evolution of a "modern" and secular political culture in a society with a strong oral and religious tradition, at a point in history where it has come to be dominated by print and electronic media. Given these ingredients, the relationship between political and popular culture is apt to become problematic at best and often opportunistic in fact. A process of pseudo-personalization takes place, whereby individual politicians are promoted as personally accessible and ever in tune, virtually on a mystic level, with the experiences of the common people.

Of course, these are important theoretical concerns, but as Waters pursues them, Rastafari tends to slip from view. Waters has used Rastafari as a point of departure for a sociological discussion that for the most part occupies the familiar ground of race and class; after all, she herself concedes that Rastafari and reggae were only used in any consequential way by the PNP in 1972 and the JLP in 1980 (p. 295). And is this why she insists on frequently using the outsider's term "Rasta" in spite of the Brethren's admonition that there can be no Rasta without the Fari - without the far-seeing vision that helps them elude Pozzo's noose? Although Waters has provided us with some rich data that illuminate important theoretical concerns, we must still await an account that will do justice to Rastafari as an expressive political culture *seen from the inside*.

CAROL YAWNEY  
York University  
4700 Keele St.  
North York, Ontario  
Canada M3J 1P3

*Garvey: Africa, Europe, the Americas*. RUPERT LEWIS and MAUREEN WARNER-LEWIS (eds). Jamaica: Institute of Social and Economic Research, 1986. xi + 208 pp. (Paper US \$12.95)

*Garvey: Africa, Europe, the Americas* is a collection of papers presented at a week-long seminar at the University of the West Indies, Mona, Jamaica in January 1973. Published belatedly as "a tribute" (p. ix) for the centennial of Marcus Garvey's birth in 1887, the book is a good record of the strengths and weaknesses of the first wave of the revisionism that has deepened our understanding of the man and his movement, the Universal Negro Improvement Association (UNIA).

The papers reflect the resurgence of black nationalism in the late 1960s and early 1970s, and the general disappointment with the fruits of independence in Africa and the Caribbean and the civil rights movement in the United States. These political sensibilities provided the impetus for more intensive research than found in the work of earlier scholars who had minimized Garvey's significance. The only significant study before the 1970s, E. David Cronin's *Black Moses* (1955), portrayed Garvey sympathetically, but more as a curiosity, out of tune with the major trends in black life, attracting the most hopeless and desperate on the basis of utopian back-to-Africa promises. The revisionism returned Garveyism to the politics of the period.

The volume under review includes two pieces on the United States, three on the West Indies, two on Africa, and one on Garvey's attempts to petition the League of Nations. All of the essays associate the rise of Garvey and the UNIA with the growth of mass movements and mass ideologies during and after World War I. But most of them falter because their authors assume that Garvey was the leading force in the black resurgence. Accordingly, they do not ask why people joined and how the UNIA was built, but why the movement declined. Most present simplistic answers: government repression or treacherous rivals.

Ted Vincent traces the split between Garveyism and the U.S. left, but discusses the conflict in naive ideological terms. Vincent assumes that movements rise and fall because of correct ideology and finds no essential differences among the partisans, a questionable conclusion. Instead, he faults the left. "Where Garvey had acted against the radical left, it had been in reaction to their disruptive activities" (p. 191). The two examples Vincent cites are W.A. Domingo's article on the Black Star Line and Cyril Briggs' attempt to radicalize the UNIA. By making criticism equivalent to disruption, he simply adopts Garvey's point of view and denies the legitimacy of opposition to Garvey. Vincent ignores the substance of the

criticism: Domingo and Briggs questioned the possibility of building a political movement on the base of an economic enterprise, the Black Star Line, the UNIA's Pan-African shipping company. Moreover, Vincent neither examines the world-wide conditions which tamed all wartime popular insurgencies, including Garveyism, nor considers the notion that defeats often exacerbate political differences.

Emory J. Tolbert's essay on the UNIA in California, a preview of his more substantial book on the UNIA in Los Angeles (1980), was especially useful in 1973 when Garveyism was often examined simply from the vantage point of New York politics. Yet, this essay, too, is dominated by an indiscriminating discussion of the splits in the UNIA. Garvey's opponents are motivated by jealousy; Garvey's triumph is documented by the UNIA's newspaper, which Tolbert accepts uncritically. Tolbert's book acknowledges that Noah Thompson, the villain of the essay, represented a significant group of well-educated and comfortable people in the UNIA. Thompson led a group out of the UNIA because he questioned Garvey's use of UNIA monies and advocated investment in California. Regionalism and class differences among blacks were important, and ideological differences minor. Implicitly, Tolbert's work places the UNIA closer to the tradition of racial enterprise, than political radicalism.

Rupert Lewis addresses the promising topic of Garvey's second Jamaican period, 1927-35, especially the formation of Garvey's People's Political Party in 1929. Unfortunately, there is little fresh research or thinking here. The essay is riddled with errors: the Jamaica Agriculture Society did not represent small and medium-sized farmers, bananas were a major, not minor crop. Politics are muddled. Lewis views the small proprietors' opposition to Garvey as a sign that they were siding with "the imperialists and the large landowners" (p. 106). On the other hand, Garvey's alliance with one of the leading white planters of the country, was "politically pragmatic" (n. 30, p. 110), and thus acceptable. The politics of the peasantry and landowners are important, but Ken Post's treatment (1978) is superior.

Tony Martin's essay on Trinidad contains new information on UNIA personalities on the island. But like his book *Race First* (1976), the essay employs passionate advocacy, not evidence and careful argument, to make Garvey the leading force in postwar politics. Martin associates the UNIA with the leading popular organization on the island, the Trinidad Workingmen's Association. Yet the link with this union is not made systematically, and it remains unclear what the UNIA was doing other than performing well-known fraternal and social functions. Martin distorts evidence. Referring to the labor strikes in 1919, he concludes that "[U.S.] Consul Baker placed much of the blame for these events on Garvey" (p.

57). But the six-page document Martin cites does not mention Garvey at all and the UNIA's newspaper, the *Negro World* only on the last page. W.F. Elkins's essay documents the range of policies adopted by colonial authorities toward the *Negro World* during the postwar popular upsurges in the Caribbean.

The best essay in the volume is Arnold Hughes's assessment of Garveyism in Africa. Hughes is well-read in the sources and literature of Pan-Africanism and African politics. He reads all evidence critically, noting the partisan account of Mrs. Amy Jacques Garvey's version of the Liberian expedition as well as the fanciful accounts of the colonialist vision of links between the UNIA and Bolshevism. Hughes locates Garvey's main appeal among the westernized urban strata, explains the way some Garveyite ideas became mixed with local popular struggles, and treats the rejection or acceptance of the UNIA as a function of the particular agendas of African groups and the credibility of UNIA projects. Thus, some elite Africans, confronted with a postwar shipping shortage, were interested in the Black Star Line. When the line proved unable to provide services, their interest in the UNIA ended.

G.O. Olusanya's essay on Garvey and Nigeria supports Hughes's general assessment. Finally, George Huggins's recounting of Garvey's appeals to the League of Nations provides interesting data, but treats the subject in a vacuum, apart from the changing fortunes of the UNIA.

Studies of Garveyism have the potential to enhance our understanding of popular movements and class relations in the interwar years. There is a danger, however, that unanalytic "tributes", innocent of broader historical work and the study of social movements, will isolate Garveyism as much as the older views of the man and the movement.

#### REFERENCES

- CRONON, E. DAVID, 1955. *Black Moses: The story of Marcus Garvey and the Universal Negro Improvement Association*. Madison, Wisc.: University of Wisconsin Press.
- MARTIN, TONY, 1976. *Race first: the ideological and organizational struggles of Marcus Garvey and the Universal Negro Improvement Association*. Westport, Ct.: Greenwood Press.
- KEN POST, 1978. *Arise ye starvelings: the Jamaican labour rebellion of 1938 and its aftermath*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff.

TOLBERT, EMORY J., 1980. *The UNIA and black Los Angeles: ideology and community in the American Garvey movement*. Los Angeles: University of California Press.

JUDITH STEIN  
Department of History  
The City College of New York  
New York, NY 10031, U.S.A.

*Slave culture: nationalist theory and the foundations of Black America*.  
STERLING STUCKEY. New York: Oxford University Press, 1987. vii + 425  
pp. (Cloth US \$27.50, Paper US \$9.95)

In this elegantly written book, Sterling Stuckey identifies as a central theme in Afro-American thought the struggle over an appropriate term by which black Americans might designate themselves. He quotes Samuel Cornish, editor of the *Colored American*, writing in the first issue of that newspaper: "We are written about, preached to, and prayed for as Negroes, Africans, and blacks, all of which have been stereotyped as names of reproach, and on that account, if no other, are unacceptable." He continued: "Let us and our friends unite, in baptizing the term 'Colored Americans', and henceforth let us be written of, preached of and prayed for as such." "It is the true term" Cornish concluded, "and one which is above reproach" (p. 209). Stuckey brilliantly analyzes that theme by probing the origins of African-American culture during slavery and by examining the thought of such major nationalist theorists as David Walker, Henry Highland Garnet, W.E.B. DuBois, and Paul Robeson.

Stuckey's primary concern is with nationalist theory, i.e. the quest for unity, autonomy in the black's struggle for freedom as a distinct people in the United States. Stuckey cogently argues that though most nationalist theorists were "exposed to main currents of African culture", they did not fully understand "how those currents might contribute to the surge toward liberation they wanted to initiate". Nationalist theorists in the main have been very clear on the goal of black self-determination, but less so on the means. They have stressed the need for unity without adequately acknowledging important sustaining qualities of African-American culture.

Stuckey suggests that black culture in the United States is essentially African. He demonstrates how slaves in the United States imported from various areas of West Africa bridged their differences and came together

as a single people. In religious expression, story telling, and burial rites, slaves fused African customs into a culture that was palpably distinctive from the broader society. Not until the mid-nineteenth century did Christian ministers make a concerted effort to bring slaves into their churches. By that time, African-influenced forms of worship and an African cosmology were deeply embedded within the slave communities of the American South and the free black communities of the North. The "ring shout" was the central feature in the circle of culture that made black people in America the first Pan-Africanists. Color became a critical source of unity, more pronounced than in other slave societies where class distinctions and African ethnicity were more salient. Contrary to many previous studies on the subject, Stuckey argues that the medium of black acculturation was primarily African, rather than potential common denominators such as the English language, Christianity, and the American physical environment.

To comprehend Stuckey's argument fully, one must read his notes. In note 73, Chapter one, for instance, he explains the persistence of African spiritual and artistic influences in Virginia despite a ban on the foreign slave trade there by 1778. He reasons persuasively that African cultural continuities did not depend on the constant infusion of African-born slaves. Long after the ban on the foreign slave trade to Virginia, there was evidence of African cultural forms in local behavior.

Those cultural forms were almost certainly all around both David Walker and Henry Highland Garnet who rose to prominence as nationalist spokesmen before the American Civil War. Stuckey characterizes Walker, who was born of a slave father and free mother in Wilmington, North Carolina, in 1785, as "the father of black nationalist theory in America". Ironically, although Walker grew up in an environment rich in African cultural expression, he did not draw on its contemporary manifestations to underscore his call for African unity. He drew more on the accomplishments of African peoples in the ancient world, the distinctive African moral character, and the need for African autonomy than on living cultural forms of his time.

Neither Walker nor Garnet, who was born a slave in New Market, Maryland, appreciated "the extent to which African values were, in a positive sense, a continuing and decisive force in the (lives) of (their) people." Both advocated a form of nationalism more political than cultural. At a greater remove from slavery and the origins of African-American culture than Walker and Garnet, DuBois and Robeson reversed the nationalist impulse, with a greater emphasis on culture. Both held "that people of African ancestry have spiritual, artistic, and psychological qualities that distinguish them from Europeans". DuBois, however, under-estimated the

culture of the mass of black people and therefore placed too much faith in educated African-Americans, "the talented tenth", to lead the race. Robeson, more than DuBois, recognized the common cultural lineaments among Africans worldwide. Like nationalist theorists before him, Robeson expected that black people would reach their potential and achieve racial equality through self-assertion rather than through imitation of other cultures.

Given the masterful quality of Stuckey's interpretation of nationalist theory, one may question his assessment of Marcus Garvey. Stuckey appears to be rather ambivalent. There is only one entry under Garvey's name in the index. The two references to Garvey in the text seem at odds with each other. Early on, Stuckey states: "The nationalists' concern for values that go beyond race has largely been obscured by the rise of Marcus Garvey and other *less sophisticated* 'nationalist' thinkers" (emphasis added, p. 229). Later, he writes: "Only Marcus Garvey affected the sense of African consciousness of more black people in Africa, the West Indies, and the United States over the first forty years of the century than did Robeson" (p. 350). The resolution of the contrary inferences to be drawn from these quotations can only be settled by the author. It is usually the case with great books that they stimulate the mind and make you crave for more. This superb study definitely falls into that category.

ROBERT L. HARRIS, JR.  
Africana Studies and Research Center  
Cornell University  
310 Triphammer Road  
Ithaca, NY 14853, U.S.A.

*Guyana: politics in a plantation society.* CHAITRAM SINGH. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1988. xiv + 156 pp. (Cloth US \$37.95)

Rumors spread through Guyana in late 1988 that President Desmond Hoyte was preparing for a snap election in order to renew the mandate of his People's National Congress (PNC) in the face of massive discontent. No one really expected the next polling of the electorate to be any fairer than the ones that took place in an atmosphere of deceit in 1968, 1973, 1978, 1980, and 1985. In Britain's other former Caribbean colonies the "rascals" can be removed by outraged voters. This cannot happen in Guyana; the "rascals" count the votes.



While skimming over Guyanese history before World War II, Chaitram Singh has still produced a short, useful summary of the main events since the formation of the People's Progressive Party (PPP) in 1950. Singh, a West Point graduate and former member of the Guyana Defense Force (GDF), now teaches at a U.S. college. He quickly defines the major cause of the Guyanese catastrophe: ethnic hostility between Black and East Indian which has been intensified over the years by a small, well-armed Black minority determined to retain power even if it destroys the nation it claims to be saving.

Regrettably, Singh fails to effectively explore the complex issue of cultural pluralism in Guyana or to compare the Guyanese reality with culturally plural societies in Trinidad and Suriname. The fragile unity between Blacks and East Indians which enabled the formation of the socialist-oriented PPP might have shattered even without the lamentable arrival of British gunboats in 1953 but, in retrospect, this intervention (p. 25) was "unquestionably excessive" and led to disastrous consequences. Within a few years, two major parties, organized on racial lines, existed in Guyana. The British successfully exploited the ambitions and differences dividing the pragmatic, moderately socialist Black politician, Forbes Burnham, and the more doctrinaire Marxist, pro-Soviet, East Indian leader, Cheddi Jagan.

Still, Jagan kept winning elections and to the consternation of the Kennedy administration, it appeared as though a Marxist would lead British Guyana to independence. Singh concludes (p. 32) that it required a "massive intervention" by the Central Intelligence Agency and the AFL-CIO to wreck Jagan between 1962 and 1964. Confident of U.S. support, Burnham refused a coalition proposal and demanded (p. 31) "a complete capitulation by Jagan". Washington's pressure, added to Jagan's naiveté, allowed the British to demand one more election, but on the basis of proportional representation. Jagan garnered 46% of the vote in this last free election in 1964 but proportional representation allowed Burnham to add his 41% to the 12% obtained by the United Force, a middle class party, and to form a government.

For Burnham's PNC, the long-range problem of proportional representation was linked to the fact that the East Indians already constituted 51% of the nation. With a larger birthrate they would soon outvote any other racial combination. Burnham resolved this issue just after independence in 1966. He outmaneuvered his coalition partner, altered the electoral rolls, added huge numbers of overseas voters, and doctored the electoral commission. The 1968 poll became the first of a series of dishonest and fraudulent elections.

Confident that the U.S. would not scuttle him if the alternative was

Jagan, Burnham, still a socialist and aspiring to a role in the non-aligned world, marched leftwards in the 1970s. Guyana became a Cooperative Republic in 1970; the key sugar and bauxite industries were nationalized. Soon the government owned 80% of the economy. By 1974, Burnham insisted upon the "paramountcy" of the PNC over every aspect of Guyanese life even though opposition parties were still tolerated. Two years later, he announced the Marxist-Leninist foundations of the PNC, giving Guyana the rare distinction of having two such parties. But this was all rhetoric. Nothing would work – not capitalism, a mixed economy, socialism, or communism – until national unity had been reestablished. This Burnham failed to do and it remains the overwhelming failure which diminishes his few achievements. There was a moment in the mid-1970s when it appeared that Jagan and Burnham might come together, but the Black militants upon whose shoulders Burnham had ridden to power were unwilling to share the plums of office with the East Indians. Burnham returned to his dependence on several Black-dominated organizations, primarily the GDF and the police, along with the unemployed rowdies of Georgetown.

Singh nicely demonstrates the concern Burnham felt when the multi-racial Working People's Alliance (WPA) was established in 1974. Pledged to racial harmony, democratic socialism, and free elections, it attracted considerable support but was dealt a harsh blow when its most prominent leader, Walter Rodney, was murdered, apparently with government complicity, in 1980. Middle class and religious groups intensified their opposition; and, to Burnham's dismay, he lost some Black working-class support as the economy crumbled. A lengthy new constitution in 1980 entrenched certain socialist planks but also gave immense power to Burnham, Guyana's first Executive President. By the mid-1980s there was massive unemployment, food shortages, electrical outages, repression of dissent, soaring trade deficits, and a complete paralysis of national will.

Burnham's death in 1985 came as a shock, but the succession went smoothly despite the departure of the charismatic chieftain. Desmond Hoyte, a long-time associate, assumed the Presidency while Hamilton Green, the ambitious, popular party organizer became Prime Minister. Hoyte ought to have reached out for national unity by forming a broad-based coalition regime or by permitting impartial elections. Anticipating a massive rejection, he opted for a repeat of Burnhamism in the December 1985 election which the *Catholic Standard* (p. 64) called "the most flagrantly rigged" in Guyana's history. Hoyte has, however, improved relations with Washington and the International Monetary Fund in order to qualify for desperately-needed loans. His apparent pragmatism and retreat from socialism pleased the Reagan administration.

Unfortunately, Singh cannot resist an assault upon "socialism" and "dependency theory". Having demonstrated that racial division remains Guyana's basic flaw, it makes little sense to write that government regulation of the economy (p. 107) "is unquestionably the principal explanatory variable behind the protracted malaise afflicting Guyana" and to observe (p. 115) that "cooperative socialism has been a dramatic and costly failure". There is nothing economically destructive about the theory of cooperative socialism; it has simply not been tried in Guyana. Careful economic planning and the shrewd allocation of resources are essential for poor, underdeveloped countries, especially one dependent upon the export of sugar, bauxite, and rice.

Singh concludes that no one can predict Guyana's future. An uprising by the 80% of the unarmed population hostile to the PNC seems unlikely. What Guyana requires is a free and fair election presided over by a neutral Caribbean team of observers to be followed by the creation of a broad-based government of national unity. Recovery will take time but without this first step, there is little hope for the long-suffering Guyanese people.

THOMAS J. SPINNER, Jr.  
Department of History  
University of Vermont  
Burlington, VT 05405, U.S.A.

*C.L.R. James: The artist as revolutionary.* PAUL BUHLE. New York & London: Verso, 1988. 197 pp. (Cloth US \$35.00, Paper US \$13.95)

You came off the Brixton tube stop in South London, went around the bend, descended to Railton Road, passing the vibrant outdoor West Indian food market and arrived at a non-descript corner dwelling that houses the *Race Today* Collective. Ascending to the third floor you entered an all-purpose bedroom, office, library, salon, classroom. Reclining on his bed, gazing out an opaque window on a greyish world, open books strewn about and the T.V. blaring, was Nello, a.k.a. Cyrill Lionel Robert James, aged 88. Many decades of struggle behind him, James had seen it all, every species of inhumanity available on four continents. Yet, up until his recent death, he retained an unshakable confidence in the "people" and thereby his undisputed throne as spiritual magus to the "culture as politics" wing of the English-speaking Left.

Best known to historians for his monumental account of the Haitian Revolution (*The black Jacobins: Toussaint L'Ouverture and the San Domingo revolution*. London 1938), James has amassed a remarkable record as journalist, sportswriter, litterateur, critic, political activist, social theorist, and Pan-African ideologue. An utter cultural maverick, James has never been popular. Too erudite for the masses and too radical for elites, he has trod a long, lonely path from his early days of stick-fighting and cricket in Tunapuna and Arima, Trinidadian villages on a social landscape drawn skilfully by Naipaul, to the precincts of the BBC and the high councils of the near- and pseudo-Left in Britain and America.

Paul Buhle's account of the life and thought of James will interest a wide range of readers including Africanists, Afro-Americanists, Caribbeanists, colonialists, and leftists of any description. Director of the Oral History of the American Left project at NYU, the author is well versed in the politico-literary movements that surrounded James during a near-century of organizing, activism, lecturing, and writing on a wide range of issues. But his effort to untangle the sundry "tendencies" within the anemic American Left (Chapter 2) produces such a garble that one wonders how the editor(s) got past it. I cannot adequately cover his book without writing another; any more than the author can touch on the work of James short of volumes. Such is the magnitude of this "great-souled man" of Aristotle's reverie.

In 1932 James departed his native island for Liverpool and the urban world that spawned Négritude, Pan-Africanism and the Harlem Renaissance. In pursuit of "the absurdities of world revolution", James soon threw himself onto the stage of modern history, jockeying variously to forge an alliance between anti-colonialist forces and the larger British labor and splinter left movements. The experience transformed the modest journalist school teacher into a revolutionary of extraordinary vision and permanent commitment. In 1938 (for reasons never made clear) he left for the United States, where he pursued the course of a Trotskyist pamphleteer, familiarizing himself with everything from a Missouri sharecroppers strike to the range of European-derived urban, mostly Jewish permutations of Leninism. After fifteen frustrating but very productive years he was interned on Ellis Island in 1952, where, awaiting deportation, he penned *Mariners, renegades and castaways*, an exegesis of *Moby Dick* that threatens to eclipse Melville's allegory, and puts him squarely in the company of Emerson.

It was also during this travail that his attention turned to African independence. A personal mentor to Nkrumah during 1943-45, by 1960 James found himself in Ghana, hoping to save the independence movement

from degeneration. His hopes for West African development were dashed as neo-colonialism fastened its grip even tighter on the ancestral continent. He then strove for West Indian federation and social revolution in his native Trinidad, only to find himself once again out-manuevered by a now stock cast – oil companies, Marines and the native compradores.

This was not an easy book to write. The author, a long-time follower of his subject and a dedicated preserver of his legacy, succeeds admirably in tying together the disparate strands of a complex career in the context of a barely intelligible evolution of the Left and pseudo-left in this century. Yet the essence of James's greatness escapes the biographer, who seems more concerned with James' failure to lead the masses to emancipation or to play the role of bourgeois family man (contradictory expectations), than with his phenomenal contributions to the anti-colonial discourse.

The brief treatment given James's single most significant work – *The black Jacobins* – and the frequent lamentations on his abstention from racial and even popular issues evince a desire to make James into what he is not. He is above all a gentleman of the old school. Racial rhetoric is beneath him. He sees little need to make the self-evident evident. A demagogue or enthusiast for petty ephemeral causes he is not. Nor does his recognition of the radical potential of the feminist critique make him a feminist. His vision is always global and his sociology as recondite as Shakespeare's. Few have tried to deal with James because he is simply too large, elusive of any label or category. His *magnus opus* is a blueprint, a model, a manifesto of the twentieth-century national liberation struggle. In it he is the first to turn colonial history on its head; to show the profound impact of Caliban's initiatives on the course of metropolitan and world developments. It is also for James a bold venture into the dense ambience of French history and thought, one rarely traversed by anglophone radicals.

James achieves the heights he does because he is the total outsider. He thinks in the very long term and as a colonial man, he labors consciously under the weight of a heavy past. Born in the shadow of a major slave plantation at Tunapuna, he exhibits the wise deliberation of one who knows the burdens of village life, where the downward pull of the mass upon the individual and the collective strategy to preserve stasis are keys both to daily survival and the analysis of post-colonial society. He barely articulates this experience; but it is assumed in all he does. The world for James is a large village laboring under the weight of this same strategy of Inertia. Despite this experience, nothing appears capable of reducing his faith in the masses, his certainty of long-term political progress, his confidence in the high values of British civilization and its West Indian variants. It is no deficiency of the author that James cannot fit into this

brief political biography; he barely fits into the world. We, the Lilliputians he will leave behind, will simply have to step back and approach him piecemeal.

T. FIEHRER  
215 Fairway  
New Orleans, LA 70124, U.S.A.

*For bread, justice and freedom: a political biography of George Weekes.*  
KHAFA KAMBON. London: New Beacon Books, 1988. xi + 353 pp. (Cloth UK£ 18.50, Paper UK £8.95)

In light of the recent death of C.L.R. James, Khafra Kambon's fine biography of George Weekes has become especially timely. One reads *about* James's historic role in many places these days, from the West Indian weeklies to the London *Independent* and *Guardian* to the *New York Times* and *Village Voice*. But only two of the organizations that James inspired or whose ideals he hoped to shape have survived. One is a political party. Antigua's Afro-Caribbean Liberation Movement (led by James's disciple Tim Hector) continues to be the island's opposition on the left, and publishes the country's main weekly press. The other is a labor organization: Trinidad's Oilfield Workers Trade Union (OWTU), whose members met the plane bearing James's corpse and marched his body through the streets of Port of Spain proudly, even defiantly. To them fell the duty and honor of taking him home. For the OWTU faithful and especially the oldtimers, James had been synonymous with the radical struggle which began in the 1930s and continued on through independence days, first with and then against Dr. Eric Williams. George Weekes, longtime OWTU President General ("P-Gee", as everybody put it) spoke of him always in reverential tones. James in turn honored Weekes as a chief hope for Trinidad's future. The two shared an unfulfilled dream.

Weekes was (like James) the son of a teacher, born in rural Toco, in 1921. Such teachers lived a miserable life, but also had a very great importance: terribly underpaid, and under the thumb of the local priest to boot, they traveled as much as the roads permitted and frequently made themselves the organic intellectuals of anti-colonial ferment. Edgar Weekes indeed sympathized with Captain Cipriani and the emerging labor movement of the 1920s and, Kambon suggests, conveyed as much to his son.

At age 10, George moved with his parents to Port of Spain, where he acquired the nickname "Tiger". By the time of the dramatic 1937 strike, George was back in Toco, but he had absorbed many influences, among them Uriah "Buzz" Butler's dramatic leadership of labor and his arrest by the colonial government.

The Second World War permitted George Weekes, like so many others, to earn "real money" in the army, and to engage fascism (racism) directly and militarily. The war also introduced him to North American racism (in a Virginia boot camp), and to parallel British treatment of the African soldier. He returned to Trinidad, in 1945, eager to absorb Marxist literature – not for its theoretical doctrines as such, but for wisdom in grasping the existing system in order to obtain "the Just" (his term), i.e. justice for all.

He joined the West Indian Independence Party, which grew out of several Marxist study groups and local political movements and which was most notable for its intellectual luminaries (including John La Rose, one of James' later intimates and to this day, publisher of New Beacon Books). Weekes, by this time an oil pipefitter, also joined the African Nationalist Movement (renamed the Pan African League). He might have merged these two identities with more effect, had the OWTU remained the militant organization it had been during the late 1930s. However, colonial repression and North American appeals to postwar anti-communism tamed the union's leadership.

Weekes – Kambon reminds us perhaps a few too many times – had all the makings of a rank-and-file leader. He immersed his whole self in his work, which he regarded not as the championing of one union but rather the promotion of working class solidarity across organizational, racial and occupational lines. He won local union office first in 1955, and allied himself on most (but not all) issues with the "Rebels", a militant faction which opposed John Rojas' cautious leadership. Ultimately, the Rebels made him their champion, electing him President General in 1962. Weekes particularly well suited the militant mood of the nation rising out of colonialism, as Eric Williams proclaimed "Massa Day Done".

Williams shifted directions not long after independence, accepting neo-colonialist economic dictates albeit with vacillating, sometimes radical-sounding rhetoric. Responding to a drop in world oil prices, "the Doctor" sought to rein in the OWTU and to co-opt Weekes for the purpose. Weekes refused. Ministers of government and conservative trade unionists deployed the commercial media to accuse Weekes of all sorts of follies, from Communism to corruption. Weekes for his part took a hard line against the multinationals, insisting upon, and gaining for the oil workers an

employment stability, a forty hour week and significant advances in wages.

By 1965, social tensions had spread and Weekes narrowly averted an assassination attempt, apparently made at the instigation of rival union leaders in sugarcane production. Though president of the nation's Trade Union Congress, Weekes could not overcome union divisions or halt the passage of the repressive Industrial Stabilization Act. Trinidad and Tobago's two leaders had reached a standoff. As Kambon argues, Williams controlled the political situation but misreckoned the degree of control that he could exert upon the oil workers. Weekes, for his part, resigned from his post at the TUC. But he continued, as OWTU leader, to argue the case for higher wages instead of higher profits in oil. He would not, or could not, make the OWTU into a political alternative: that was Weekes' great strength (because it prevented fragmentation), but also his weakness.

Weekes directly challenged Williams' political rule only once. Following James' lead, he endorsed the Workers and Farmers Party, which, in 1966, sought a new basis for opposition to neo-colonialism. It failed badly as a vote-getter, victim to the racial division which virtually threw Afro-Caribbeans into the PNM and East Indians into the Democratic Labor Party.

Weekes devoted his considerable energies instead to rebuilding a union movement drained by the ISA and to consolidating the OWTU itself. Another strand of his effort was the crusade to bring workers together across racial lines. Still another was to make Afro-Caribbeans in particular aware of their legacy, by recuperating the memory of "Buzz" Butler and the strikes of 1937. These strands came together in a series of dramatic activities in the late 1960s aimed against retrenchment. Marches, demonstrations, strikes that were de facto political challenges, met with increasingly harsh responses from authorities. Soon, Black Power slogans from the US incited a political constituency of students that had hardly existed before, with a vociferousness which surprised everyone. Weekes sought to bring students and workers together. In the massive confrontation of 1970, the Black Power revolt of workers, students and soldiers in and around Port of Spain, it seemed as if revolution might succeed where parliamentary challenge had failed.

Kambon speaks here from personal experience as a Black Power militant, and the pages of *For bread, justice and freedom* fairly run over with his journalistic recollections. It was an exciting moment, but when the smoke had finally cleared, by 1972 or so, Williams remained in control of the country, and Weekes (after more than a year of imprisonment) in control of the union. So it continued, through years of industrial consolidation, sporadic repression, and continual political maneuvering. Several other



high points, such as the crowd of more than 25,000 at Skinner Point, San Fernando, in 1975, offered brief hopes of dramatic social transformation. Yet in the end, not even Williams' 1981 death and the defeat of the PNM in 1986 made much difference. Nor did the nationalization of refineries and land-based oil wells. The moment had passed, again and again.

Kambon tries too hard to extricate Weekes – in retirement from the union, and in the Senate for the coalition government – from these consequences. There is no need, really.

PAUL BUHLE  
Oral History of the American Left  
Tamiment Library  
New York University  
New York, NY 10003, U.S.A.

*Trujillo y Haiti. Vol. 1 (1930-1937).* BERNARDO VEGA. Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic: Fundación Cultural Dominicana, 1988. 464 pp. (Paper, n.p. )

In the first week of October 1937, an estimated forty thousand peasants of Haitian origin living in the border regions of the Dominican Republic were brutally and systematically attacked by the Dominican army. Of these, nearly half were killed, almost all by machete. The rest escaped to Haiti. Bernardo Vega's study is the first comprehensive treatment of the background to this tumultuous and perplexing chapter in the history of the island. He presents a rich compilation of primary materials documenting the chain of events preceding the massacre.

This volume is the first in a series of three that Bernardo Vega will publish on Haitian-Dominican relations during the Trujillo period (1930-1961). The bulk of data draws upon the voluminous United States Archives' microfilms of American Legation Reports from Santo Domingo (then called Ciudad Trujillo) and Port-au-Prince. The work proceeds chronologically, each chapter summarizing one year (or a portion thereof) of Haitian-Dominican relations. The final sections describe the massacre and outline its possible causes. The volume treats in minute detail both Trujillo's foreign policy toward Haiti and the government's concerns over Haitian immigration to the Dominican Republic during the first seven years of the

regime. The issues raised range from Haitian contract laborers in the sugar industry to Trujillo's efforts to suborn prominent Haitian political figures. Vega does not offer a new analytical framework for the era, but he provides a far more extensive and nuanced study than existing secondary sources. To his credit, he does not eschew the many apparent contradictions in Haitian-Dominican relations of the period.

The book is an important source for all historians interested in this critical moment of state formation in both Haiti and the Dominican Republic. The two countries followed divergent paths as they surfaced from their respective military occupations by the United States. The expansion of its sugar industry and the stronger state and army fostered by Trujillo made the Dominican Republic economically and militarily superior to Haiti for the first time. This new balance of power on the island conditioned the timing of the massacre. The killings were an act of aggression that could only have been ordered by a leader confident of his power in the face of possible retaliation and war, and also of potential domestic opposition.

Vega's examination of Haitian-Dominican relations during this period seeks to reveal the still obscure causes of the 1937 massacre, even though his argument concerning these becomes explicit only in the concluding pages. The traditional historiography of the massacre describes the event as the logical outcome of a deep anti-Haitian sentiment on the part of Trujillo and Dominicans in general. The Dominican elite had always exhibited a certain disdain for and fear of Haiti. In the nineteenth century, these attitudes responded to Haiti's superior military strength and the Haitian Occupation of the Dominican Republic from 1822 to 1844. In the twentieth century, the Dominican elite stressed instead the supposedly negative social and "racial" effects of Haitian immigration to the Dominican Republic. Vega's argument, however, differs from the traditional historiography. Though anti-Haitianism was strong among the Dominican elite, Vega amply demonstrates that this ideology was not operative in the first seven years of the Trujillato in any significant or unusual way. On the contrary, he asserts it was counteracted by official state policy favorable to Haiti and Haitians. Thus, he asserts that anti-Haitianism provided only the *ex-post facto* ideology and justification for the massacre.

Vega carefully documents his counterargument to the conventional view of the massacre as the eruption of a volatile anti-Haitian sentiment. He shows clearly that the pre-massacre period was, in fact, characterized by a unique "pro-Haitian" state ideology sponsored by Trujillo. Indeed, it was the only official policy of this kind in the history of the island, entailing frequent political and cultural interchanges and endless press coverage and

speeches exhorting Haitian-Dominican fraternity and peaceful collaboration. Attended by a large entourage, Trujillo visited Port-au-Prince in 1936, where he handed out gifts to the crowds. The day was declared a national holiday in Haiti. Memorably, Trujillo kissed the Haitian flag during this celebration, declaring his love for the Haitian people.

The most important concrete achievement of this inter-state solidarity was the finalization in 1936 of the first definitive border treaty between the two nations. Trujillo's subordinates proposed that he and Haitian President Sténio Vincent jointly receive the Nobel Peace Prize for this accord. Vega argues that Trujillo initially sought close relations with Haiti because of his fears concerning the Dominican opposition then in exile in Haiti, but that these good relations transcended, and outlived, the resolution of the exile problem. The massacre appears all the more inexplicable in light of the policy of pro-Haitianism that immediately preceded it.

Vega's near-exclusive use of US archival materials, however, may still have limited him to an official history and conventional answers. Vega's primary explanation for the massacre is the desire he attributes to Trujillo to "whiten the Dominican race" by purging the Haitian immigrant presence. Yet the ideal of racial whitening was found throughout Latin America, linked to the widely-held belief that European migration was a recipe for social progress and economic development.

Vega stresses the desultory efforts on the part of the Dominican government to encourage white immigration as evidence for elite interest in expelling the Haitians (who are on the average darker-skinned than Dominicans). As in most of Latin America, however, these efforts were subordinated to economic constraints and remained essentially *beaux gestes*. The country never provided sufficient incentives to attract or keep European immigrants. The few thousand foreigners who actually arrived under Trujillo were mostly Jewish and Spanish refugees who had few, if any, other alternatives. Also, an overarching desire on the part of the Dominican state to eradicate the Haitian presence might have been reflected first in an affective immigration policy, and not in a massacre. Yet no law was ever enacted against Haitian immigration prior to the killings. Rather, an unlimited number of Haitians were allowed to reside in the Republic simply upon payment of a moderate 6-peso fee. On the other hand, even if Trujillo did not order the killings specifically because of racist or anti-Haitian attitudes, it is doubtful the massacre could have erupted were it not for a virulent anti-Haitian tradition among the elite, an attitude which legitimated the killings and made them politically feasible.

Perhaps the most provocative and innovative discussion in the study

is Vega's elaboration of the tensions between the United States and Trujillo over the predominant use of Haitian canecutters by the large American sugarmills. The Dominican press during this period repeatedly condemned this dependence on foreign migrant labor. Resentment was exacerbated by international economic depression and high unemployment. The grievance was articulated in the press not in racial but economic terms. Vega emphasizes that desire for the nationalization of the labor force in the sugar industry was, on the contrary, articulated to the United States as a racial concern, as a fear of the "degeneration" of the race. Trujillo may have felt compelled, however, to express his motives in racial terms, which in fact appealed to contemporary US attitudes, rather than in economic terms, which contradicted American interests.

The overall picture that emerges from Vega's text is an aggressive policy on the part of Trujillo to increasingly tax the US companies for the use of Haitian labor, and thereby either collect additional revenues, or force the nationalization of the workforce. The latter would have provided much gainful employment and increased the domestic market, thus spurring economic development and revival. Trujillo's actions in this regard, as in carrying out the massacre, show him to be more than the US puppet he is often assumed to have been.

One weakness with Vega's analysis is that he collapses the issue of the Haitian sugar workers in the Dominican Republic and that of the Haitian border presence in the country into a single Haitian problem, when really they are completely different situations. His study thus treats tensions over Haitian labor policies in the American sugar companies as though they led up to the massacre. Yet, as he points out, the massacre scarcely touched the Haitian workers in these companies. Indeed, these were the only Haitians spared. Ultimately, the Haitian sugarworkers were not even repatriated or deported, as occurred in Cuba from 1927 to 1937 in wake of falling sugar prices and a popular upsurge to nationalize the labor force. Instead the October massacre struck at the largely-integrated Haitian peasant population in the Dominican border, something which seems to defy any economic explanation based on national interests.

Vega's work is a rich and meticulous compendium of material on the daily twists and turns of Haitian-Dominican relations under the mercurial Trujillo. His twenty-sixth book thus makes yet another impressive and valuable contribution to Dominican historiography. If, fifty-two years after the massacre, little more can be said with any certainty about the brutal event's causes, except that the killings were most likely triggered by Trujillo's goal of increasing his political-economic power, this is not Vega's fault.

Rather it serves as a poignant reminder of just how far the shadow of Trujillo's silence has extended.

ROBIN DERBY & RICHARD TURITS  
Department of History  
The University of Chicago  
Chicago, IL 60637, U.S.A.

*The Dominican Republic: politics and development in an unsovereign state.*  
JAN KNIPPERS BLACK. Boston, London and Sidney: Allen & Unwin, 1986.  
xi + 164 pp. (Cloth US \$27.95, Paper US \$11.95)

Porfirio Díaz, Mexico's dictator in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, reportedly exclaimed, "Poor Mexico! So far from God and so close to the United States!" If a comparable epithet were devised for the Dominican Republic, it might be, "Alas, Santo Domingo! Lost en route between Havana and San Juan!" The scholarly literature on the Dominican Republic is slight in comparison to the published works on Cuba and Puerto Rico, even though the country's more than six million people comprise twenty percent of the population of the Caribbean. The disinterest in conducting research in the Dominican Republic was understandable during the reign of Rafael Trujillo, and perhaps to some extent during the first administrations of Joaquín Balaguer, ending in 1978. The flowering of scholarship and literature within the Dominican Republic, during the late 1970s and early 1980s, was not matched by attention from abroad. Now that a very old and infirm Balaguer is once again the country's president, the failure to seize the moment earlier in the 1980s appears that much more ponderous.

Jan Knippers Black boasts of having followed Dominican political fortunes for over twenty years. Black makes it clear that the book is intended primarily for non-specialists. "For the specialist...", she says, "the fun is in the footnotes" (p. xi). It is, to its merit, a description of Dominican political history and institutions, made accessible to the general reader and drawn from a somewhat centrist position.

The reader should not assume, from the subtitle, that the author has developed a theoretical twist on the concept of sovereignty which she then uses to explain recent events in the Dominican Republic. Calling the country an "unsovereign state" is a rhetorical flair used only on the cover and

title page of the book. The book in many ways focuses on the *Partido Revolucionario Dominicano* (PRD), especially the regime of late President Antonio Guzmán (1978-1982), a conservative rancher carrying the mantle of the party founded by intellectual Juan Bosch fifty years ago.

The relevance of a precise concept of the state is shown by Black's argument that "no country in the Western Hemisphere has been more firmly locked into the U.S. sphere of influence than the Dominican Republic, and in no country of the area has the course of events been more strongly influenced by residence in that sphere" (p. 116). Perhaps "country" is the operative word here, but then the notion of "unsovereign state" becomes moot. Scholars of Puerto Rico would have a strong argument with Black, since the "Free Associated State" also has the quality of being "unsovereign". The same argument on sphere of influence might be advanced for several other islands, depending on the time period. Further, Black's description of the Trujillo-Balaguer period of Dominican history demonstrates a great latitude in dealing with, catering to, and at times outbluffing North American political agents.

The specialists "fun" that the author promised for the footnotes consists largely of attributions of particular statements or positions to specific individuals she interviewed for the book, mostly in 1982 and 1985. While this study appears motivated by concerns for fairness and accountability, I was troubled by the lack of "play." Black does not treat these statements as texts which can then be subjected to a critical analysis in the framework of Dominican politics. She presents them much like a journalist might, at face value, even though a more sanguine view would recognize that the interviewees used this forum to conduct partisan warfare. Some of the footnote fun approaches gossiping, as in a note concerning the suicide of President Guzmán (p. 137). In substituting the source's authority or privilege for the analyst's acumen, Black has surrendered the role she might have treasured most.

The only chapter which does not focus on political topics is one on "social and economic structures", which discusses, in fairly general terms, race, class, demography, economic development and dependency. These are topics on which Black shows no particular novelty. The reader does not find here the typologies of Harry Hoetink, who is not cited, nor the subtleties of Juan Bosch. Instead, as if to acknowledge the difficulty she has with these topics, the chapter concludes with a synopsis of an article on a peasant leader, taken from *Grassroots Development* (Vetter 1984). In making this only foray into the countryside, Black perpetuates one of the problems with Dominican scholarship, the literally exclusive focus on Santo Domingo at the expense of the five million people who live

outside the National District. The rural population of the Dominican Republic may be subjected to immense centripetal forces emanating from the capital, but no definite image emerges of those Dominicans who are neither party leaders nor military officers.

Now that scholars have begun to pay some attention to the ties between Caribbean societies and extra-regional societies other than their metropolises, it makes sense that Black would discuss the Dominican Republic's foreign relations. But this discussion is superficial, beyond some interesting comments about the PRD and the international social-democratic movement. The relations between the Dominican Republic and Haiti, for example, merit more detailed consideration, especially in view of the strikes, demonstrations and riots in 1984 and 1985 which culminated – outside the scope of this book, to be sure – with the collapse of the Duvalier dynasty in Haiti early in 1986.

Jan Knippers Black's *The Dominican Republic* provides a useful introduction to twentieth-century Dominican political affairs, particularly the years of the Guzmán regime and the first years of Jorge Blanco's administration. This discussion, written at a time when the return to power of Joaquín Balaguer must have seemed quite remote, now stands eerily as a testament to the middle years of the 1980s. As Black continues her work, hopefully we will have a similar discussion of the later Blanco years and a serious consideration of what Balaguer's resurrection means for the Dominican people. As for now, Black demonstrates that Dominican political life did not end in 1965, but has broken new ground and holds promise for the liberation that peeked through a quarter century ago.

#### REFERENCE

- VETTER, STEPHEN, 1984. Portrait of a peasant leader: Ramon Aybar. *Grassroots Development* 8:2-11.

JAMES W. WESSMAN  
Department of Latin American and Caribbean Studies  
State University of New York at Albany  
Albany, NY 12222, U.S.A

*Militarization in the non-Hispanic Caribbean.* ALMA H. YOUNG and DION E. PHILLIPS (eds.). Boulder, Colorado: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc., 1986. ix + 178 pp. (Cloth US \$25.00)

In 1984, shortly after he was elected Prime Minister of St. Vincent and the Grenadines, James F. "Son" Mitchell invited me to have a drink with him on the veranda of his new residence. He filled the balmy night air with cleverly insightful stories and anecdotes; one of which is instructive here and which I call "a tale of two tea kettles".

Shortly after the election, Son toured government ministries and facilities to access their functioning and condition. He appeared at the headquarters of the Royal St. Vincent Constabulary and was appalled to find the old colonial station dirty and full of junk: no sheets on the beds, no common room, not even a mess for the constables to have a bite to eat or brew up a cup of tea before duty. He immediately requisitioned a tea kettle from central government stores and presented it to the assembled men and women. However, constables at the barracks up the hill adjacent to Government House heard of the newly acquired largesse down the hill and raised bitter complaints that they had been neglected. Prime Minister Mitchell purchased a tea kettle with his own money and saw to it that the dissatisfied constables were mollified. The story did not end here. Several days later word again reached Son that the officers at the barracks post had commandeered the tea kettle and taken it away from the enlisted men. The dissention compelled the Prime Minister to personally intervene into this tempest and sort out a problem that was both unsettling and fractious. Mitchell sipped his drink, eyed me squarely and said: "So this is what the United States wants to militarize in the Eastern Caribbean? That's why I asked them [the Special Forces training teams] to leave." This story is not meant to trivialize the predicament of St. Vincent or sister states, but rather to suggest that issues of social scale, different traditions and the injection of alien hardware and techniques may have a serious disequilibrating effect on Caribbean stability and traditional modes of conflict resolution. The authors in this volume all would appreciate Son's story and, in carefully written and well documented academic prose from a variety of intellectual positions, provide additional support for the Prime Minister.

Alma Young and Dion Phillips have provided us with an extremely timely and useful book. Seven social scientists (six Caribbeans and one American) have written carefully documented essays on various aspects of internally-emerging and externally-sponsored militarization, national security issues, and the arming of the state bureaucracy in the non-Hispanic



Caribbean. Six essays grapple with these phenomena in the English-speaking region, one on Dutch-speaking Suriname. Alma Young and Dion Phillips provide a most useful introduction on the economic, social and political forces that encourage militarization in the Third World. Hilbourne Watson examines the interplay of imperialism and the emergence of the authoritarian state and himself sets the theoretical stage that the other contributors all to some degree hold as a fundamental postulate. Watson asserts (p. 18): "I argue that the development of the authoritarian state in the Commonwealth Caribbean as reflected in the broadening of the scope of the military and security instruments of state power is a function of the crisis generated by the traditional exclusion of the popular masses from access to and control over the state and related structures. ... the neo-colonial model of capital accumulation, which continues to reproduce weak and precarious economic and political institutions...is the hub of the 'rise' of this authoritarian state. ...the political ruling class...is led by a petite bourgeoisie that has been unable to reproduce itself outside of the state and that must simultaneously reproduce its control over the state in alliance with local capital, sections of the productive classes, and imperialism."

A lot to chew on, but fortunately the book is eminently chewable. Phillips follows with a analysis of security issues in the Eastern Caribbean and the role played by prominent politicians who endorsed US security efforts. Ken Boodhoo places pre-coup/post-coup, pre-invasion/post-invasion violence in Grenada in an international context and reminds us again that democracy in that small land was not first threatened by Maurice Bishop but by the dark machinations of Eric Gairy. Colonial parliamentary power may have been bequeathed to Gairy, but he did not maintain it unsoiled. Betty Sedoc-Dahlberg sociologically dissects the shifting interest groups and coalitions that the military regime in Suriname attempted to assemble to support their unholy cause. Ethnic groups, churches, labor unions, university students all were first courted and later threatened by the Uzi-bearers. George K. Danns examines the internal control and external security role of the Guyanese Defense Forces. His contention that the PNC regime holds on to power at all costs is well supported by convincing fiscal expenditure and manpower recruitment evidence. Young concludes the book with the dramatic impact that the crisis in Central America is having on "peaceful" Belize and makes clear that states – no matter how small and "innocent" – could be inadvertently caught in the "east-west" struggle.

The book is not written in a theoretical fashion but rests squarely on the description and analysis of Caribbean-specific events. There is no

military-sociology jargon or inflated (and maddenly vague) international relations talk. The cumulative bibliography is appropriate and well organized, as is the index. The volume itself is handsomely bound and printed, and pleasant to the eye.

My only criticism, and merely a constructive one at that, is that the title is just a touch misleading. It would have been a great boon for the English-speaking audience had a chapter been included on the French Caribbean and the role of French might (naval and air forces in Martinique and Guadeloupe, special forces and legionnaires in Guyane) in the discourse on independence. I personally would have liked to have seen something on Jamaica, and the troubled law enforcement issues there. The omission of Haiti is glaring. Nevertheless, the editors deserve praise and thanks for assembling this unique and informative document. It is a good book important to all Caribbeanists and deserves to be read carefully.

GARY BRANA-SHUTE

Department of Cultural Anthropology  
University of Utrecht, Netherlands